

## Reviews

Wayne Crothers, with Tadashi Kobayashi and Jaqueline Berndt, *Hokusai*, Melbourne: Council of Trustees of the National Gallery of Victoria, 2017, xviii and 237 pp. ISBN: 9781925432459 (pbk).

If astonishing visitation figures, crushed gallery spaces, and record merchandise sales are the measures, The National Gallery of Victoria's 2017 Katsushika Hokusai exhibition was astounding successes. The *Hokusai* exhibition catalogue was piled high, in its hundreds, on several separate gift-shop tables, and snapped up by queues of visitors. Their fascination with Hokusai was understandable: the gorgeously presented exhibition drew viewers of all ages into Hokusai's intimate views into his own nineteenth century Japanese world. Both the exhibition and this affordable, well written, large format, and profusely illustrated catalogue allowed his creative achievements to reveal themselves through the triple threads of his humane world view, polymath curiosities, and deeply ingrained consciousness of the culturally significant currents of his era.

This volume presents three essays, each lavishly illustrated with exhibition works and comparative examples. Curator Wayne Crothers constructs a biographical summary of Hokusai's career through his principal changes of name – from Tokitara through Tetsuzō, Shunrō, Sori, Kakō, and Hokusai, to Iitsu and Gakyōrōkujin Manji. Crothers' account goes some way to explaining how intensely creative dispositions emerged in Hokusai's life, from his childhood “in a house that practiced quality craftsmanship and decorative skills,” through his apprenticeships in block-carving, the Katsushika studio, the Sōtatsu Rinpa School, his immersions in the worlds of poetry and *surimono* (luxury print) design, and his inventive resource to the rich fields of Western perspective, Shintō and Buddhist iconographies, and literary and historic pasts of China and Japan. Despite the fame he enjoyed at certain times in his life, the recurrent themes here are of a man obsessed with recording his world in drawing; a man of simple tastes, with a fascination for humble views of everyday life around him.

Art historian Tadashi Kobayashi complements Crothers' retrospective evaluation of Hokusai's creative life in his close analysis of the near contemporary account, Iijima Kyoshin's 1893 *Katsushika Hokusai den*, a record sourced in commentaries from older people with personal knowledge of Hokusai and his circles. Kobayashi situates his reading against other contemporary literary and pictorial portrayals of the artist. He juxtaposes Hokusai's market popularity against his humble, often straitened, life circumstances. He describes contemporary fascinations with the artist's personal life – especially his preferences in drink (six pages in Kyoshin's narrative) and food. He explores the tensions between Hokusai's underlying humility, professional ego, and spiritual faith, and compares his considerable *ukiyo-e* (floating world picture) reputation with jealous accusations of derivation or copying from his competitors.

Jaqueline Berndt examines the profusion of illustrative matter (almost 4000 images) of the perennially popular *Hokusai manga* to explain their infectious appeal across four centuries of viewers. Her explanation of the term *manga*, and especially her rejection of its usual understanding as ‘random sketches’ is thorough, informative and convincing. She evaluates the competing perspectives different commentators have brought to their discussions of the *manga*: as objects of exceptional power and imagination (Richard Lane); as deliberately and discretely composed volumes (Evgeny Steiner); as exercises in playful humour or social satire that so entertained Hokusai’s fans (Shimizu Isao); and finally, as (art) educational manuals so popular amongst nineteenth century Edo readers.

The catalogue of almost 170 exhibition images is presented chronologically, first as a group of early works composed between 1782 and 1830, and subsequently as groups, each dedicated to one of the mature serial projects by which Hokusai is best remembered today. Every work is reproduced clearly and in colour, and blown-up details reveal the decorative invention of Hokusai’s hand, the impressive skills of his block-cutters, and the delicate subtleties wrought by his printers. The collection presented here inevitably includes all forty-six compositions of the artist’s ‘greatest hits’, the *Thirty-six Views of Fuji* (1830-34), including two early impressions of the ubiquitous *Great Wave Off Kanagawa*. These works enjoy their timeless popularity with good reason, but for those already familiar with this series, the other catalogue illustrations offer privileged insights into the more diverse compass of Hokusai’s project. These include embryonic ‘Great Wave’ compositions from very early in Hokusai’s career. Very early works like the 1780s print *Enjoying a Cool Evening and Fireworks at Sumida River* reveal his early fascination with the diverse attitudes and dispositions of individual pictorial characters, and also the lengths to which, even then, he was able to push the creative skills of his cutters and printers. His paintings reveal delicate *sumi-e* (ink painting) calligraphic subtleties derived from Chinese painting, and individually inventive plays with transparent and opaque media (capitalizing on the risk-taking plays with accidental effects of the Rinpa School). They also reveal threads of humility, subtle humour, and alertness to the pictorial tropes of earlier *Yamato-e* (Japanese painting) preoccupations with daily life and events. They show his enthusiasms for Western-style perspective, largely derived from his familiarity with Dutch landscape views, in series like the 1802 small compositions for *The Dutch Picture Lens: Eight Views of Edo* – presented here complete with its original wrapper illustration of a *nozoki-karakuri* (in Crothers, *nozoki karakura*) ‘peep show’ optical viewing device. A number of works, like the rustic 1831 view of a *Man Washing Potatoes*, show Hokusai’s fusion of Chinese-style transparent monochrome brushwork and the atmospheric *Berorin* (Prussian) blue pigment he so favoured in his mature landscape and genre compositions.

Several *meisho-e* (famous place picture) series celebrate well-known natural phenomena, most notably in the full set of eight dramatic views of *A Tour of Waterfalls in Various Provinces* (c. 1832) and the eleven *Remarkable Views of Bridges in Various Provinces* (c. 1834). Perennial pictorial themes of *Snow, Moon and Blossoms* (1833) and the *kachô-e* (bird and flower picture) series reveal the poetic sensibilities that suffused Hokusai’s finest, most delicate, compositions. These poetic themes are explored more

explicitly here in the reproductions of portraits of poets and their verses – *A True Mirror of Chinese and Japanese Poetry* (1833-34), and the *Ogura Hyakunin isshu, One Hundred Poems Explained by the Nurse* (1835-36). Perhaps the rarest surprise, to the end of the volume, is the ornate decorative detail of Hokusai's line illustrations for a six-volume edition of *The Life of Shakyamuni* (1845). Running through all of these works is a synthesis of Hokusai's restless mind, poetic sensibility and astonishingly versatile drawing skills.

The commentaries introducing each group of works and each individual illustration are articulate and informative. They afford insights into why Hokusai's public were so engaged by his inventive mind, the popularity of perennial, and culturally significant themes, and the immediate reportage significance of, for example, series like his 1832 views of the Ryûkyû Kingdom. The text is supported by an endnotes section, select bibliography, a catalogue list of all works in the volume in romanised Japanese and English, a list of comparative illustrations and credits and acknowledgements. If the aim of the catalogue is to share the joy of learning and experiencing art, this one hits the mark. This volume provides as a fine an introduction to Hokusai and his catholic creative compass as any other recent publication. Given its broad, inclusive scope, clear presentation, and its easy readability, it deserves the popularity it has garnered, and will inform *ukiyo-e* students and general interest readers alike.

Reviewed by DAVID BELL  
University of Otago

Charlotte Horlyck and Michael J. Pettid eds., *Death, Mourning and the Afterlife in Korea: From Ancient to Contemporary Times*, Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2014, 288 pp, ISBN 978-0-8248-3968-0

How societies and communities understand and deal with death gives us great insight into their beliefs and ways of life. This volume, in ten chapters, written by scholars from a variety of disciplines, explores how Koreans over the centuries have dealt with death and dying. The book is divided thematically into four parts: The Body, Disposal, Ancestor Worship and Rites, and the Afterlife. In the Korean context, the impacts of the shamanic worldview or popular folk practices, Buddhism, Confucianism and geomancy are all critical – and an assessment of these impacts includes the ways that these interact with each other. Furthermore, the impact of the west, both in terms of the Christian and scientific medicine, are noted as introducing significant adjustments.

Part One contains two contrasting chapters, one dealing with death and burial in Medieval Korea and the other with how death was seen and understood in the critical period of the modernisation of medical practice from 1957 to 1977 at Seoul National University Hospital. The first chapter, which focuses on cremation and Buddhist funerary practices, acknowledges that there is very little historic data to work from. The conclusion is that while cremation was important at various stages, there are many competing interpretations of how significant cremation was and how funerary rites were managed. More evidence is becoming available as interest in archaeology in Korea grows.

The second chapter, “Making Death ‘Modern’” by John P. DiMoia, looks at the impact of the Minnesota Project (1954-62), in which medical consultants from the University of Minnesota helped modernise Seoul National University Hospital on their own American model. The resulting medical facility and service is, however, a fascinating combination of German academic medicine, taught through Japanese medical practitioners, American and European models of hospital management and treatment and local South Korean traditional practices of dealing with illness and death. DiMoia concludes “it is this hybrid tradition from which a specifically South Korean culture of death emerged” (p. 75).

Part Two continues the interesting pattern of a historical theme (chapter 4: “Ways of Burial in Koryŏ Times”) and a contemporary theme (chapter 5: “Death as a Nationalist Text: Reading the National Cemetery of South Korea”). As in chapter 1, chapter 4 by Charlotte Horlyck again illustrates the difficulty of writing on a subject where historical sources and archaeological evidence indicate a huge variety in ways of dealing with the dead. Common trends and patterns are difficult to discern. Clearly a sense of ongoing mutual dependence between the living and dead is apparent.

The same issue runs through the chapters in Parts Three and Four, which deal with belief about death, funerary rites and the after-life in the early Chosŏn period (1392–1910). The overall effect on the reader is to hope that further research will bring more definite results.

In Chapter 5, Guy Podoler shows how the national cemetery, with the national heroes buried on site, sanctifies their deaths. “The South assumes the role of the legitimate son and heir of pre-divided Korea by linking the dead forefathers to present-day South Korea through a tangible nationalist text” (p. 130). A chapter on how Korean people today view the afterlife and how their views and perceptions have evolved from the past would have been very enlightening and indeed important if the book is to fulfil the aims of its title.

It is striking that there are no Korean contributors to this volume, although there are many Korean language sources and works by Korean authors listed in the bibliography. Nevertheless, this volume does fill a gap in knowledge about how death, mourning, funerary rites and belief in the afterlife are expressed. The contrast in the analysis between the historic and the contemporary ways this happens, and the links between them, is fascinating and the structure of the book facilitates an appreciation of these links. A fuller study of how Christianity has influenced modern Korean thinking and practice would be helpful as 25% of the population are now Christian. Further explorations of the topic might look at modern funeral trends and practices in Korea and perhaps contrast urban and rural practices.

Nevertheless, this is a very important volume and well recommended for those interested in the topic.

*Reviewed by* STUART VOGEL  
*Auckland*

Kathleen L. Lodwick, *How Christianity Came to China: A Brief History*, Minneapolis, Minn.: Fortress Press, 2016, xxii + 259 pp, ISBN 978-1-4514-7230-1(Paperback); 978-1-5064-1028-9 (E-book)

Kathleen L. Lodwick is a well-known historian whose work *The Chinese Recorder Index: A Guide to Christian Missions in Asia 1867–1941* (1986) is a standard reference work for those studying Christian mission in China in the nineteenth century. In this work, Lodwick draws on all her academic experience and expertise to produce a highly readable and entertaining book on the history of Christianity in China. This book makes its subject accessible to people for whom this is a new topic and who want a well-researched and perceptive general account. While it covers familiar ground, this volume will also give more seasoned researchers some interesting points on the present and future situations facing Christianity in China. The title is, however, a little misleading; it is a history of the bedding down of Christianity in China as much as its arrival.

Two points immediately strike the reader. Firstly, Lodwick reflects on her own personal experiences and uses interesting anecdotes to elucidate the subjects being discussed. These stories are often whimsical and humorous. Secondly, and this is a minor but nevertheless indicative detail perhaps, is how often she uses the conversational phrase “Chinese folks” when she is describing the reactions of people in China to the missionaries’ message. This work is written in an academically competent but chatty style and is for that reason alone a worthwhile addition to the literature on the subject.

The book is divided into six chapters entitled respectively: 1. Christianity in Inner Asia and later China, 2. Denominationalism, 3. Socio-political, 4. Geographic, 5. Missionary and Chinese Biographies and 6. Four Theological Issues in the China Missions. This structure means that some subjects appear in a number of places. The Jesuit influence in China reappears numerous times, in the sections on “chronology” (or history), on missionary biographies and again under the “Theological issues” section where the Chinese Rites Controversy within the Catholic Church is described in some detail. The challenges of the translation of Christian terms into Chinese could also be better looked at as a complex and divisive issue that runs throughout the whole period and faced both Catholics and Protestants.

In a volume of this size, serious choices have to be made about which events and issues to prioritise. Some like the Rites Controversy and the arrival of the Protestant missionaries are clearly key matters to discuss. One might quibble, however, with Lodwick’s choice of her “four theological issues”. In terms of theological debate, it is difficult to go past the “terms’ controversy” or the debate about how to translate Christian terms, such as “God” and “sin” into Chinese. Equally, the alliance between the missionaries and colonialism had deep historical roots and a huge impact on the success or otherwise failure of the missionary endeavour. Both issues need to be explored further if we are to enlighten the reader who wishes to understand the broad context.

Her choice of “ecumenism”, or the unity of the Churches in ministry and mission is well chosen, although that term did not become current until the twentieth century. The three great Protestant missionary conferences of 1877, 1890 and 1912 were of huge significance in bringing missions together as were the various missionary journals,

translations and publications. While there was limited success in unifying the Church denominations that had established themselves in China, there were nevertheless many interdenominational forces in China which led to the recognition of important insights into the nature of cross-cultural missionary work. These insights were introduced very effectively by Chinese delegates into the 1910 Edinburgh Missionary Conference. These forces need more research.

Lodwick's choice of "the feminisation of Christianity" as a theological issue is a good one to highlight in the history of the Chinese Church. The contribution of European and Chinese women to the Church's growth is unquestioned. European and American women were given opportunities in China to exercise their talents and skills that did not exist at home. They took those opportunities and found that Chinese women responded in kind and were often deeply influential. Quite how the feminisation of Christianity is a "theological" issue, as opposed perhaps to an ecclesiastical, culture and/or social issue, remains to be explored. Also, her emphatic view that Hudson Taylor (1832–1905) and the China Inland Mission were "secretive" is new to this reviewer but is worth exploring.

This is a good, readable, well written and well researched introduction to Christianity in China. It would do well on reading lists for those entering in to the subject.

*Reviewed by* STUART VOGEL  
Auckland

Ambrose Mong, *Guns and Gospel: Imperialism and Evangelism in China*, Cambridge, UK: James Clarke & Co, 2016, xii +184 pp, ISBN 9780227176252

This work covers much well-documented territory about missionaries and related events in China in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The Opium war, Robert Morrison, Karl Gützlaff, James Hudson Taylor, the Taipings, the Boxers and Timothy Richard have all been widely discussed elsewhere. The distinctive feature of this volume is that the author examines the often highly ambiguous relationship between missionaries and British imperialism. His discussion of the opium trade in chapter two is especially helpful and draws out the complex nuances of the relationship between missionary and the opium trade well. This was more complex than the popular image of Gützlaff handing out Christian tracts from one side of the gunboat and opium being distributed from the other.

Ambrose Mong also states his wider aim in writing this book: "[My book] attempts to explain why, in spite of so much toil and sacrifice undertaken by foreign missionaries in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Christianity is still a minority faith in faith in China" (p. xv).

If his aim is to show that British imperialism is the cause of a lack of growth of the Christian faith in China, Mong probably achieves this aim less well. One might note, for example, that North American and German missionaries arguably experienced a different relationship to "imperialism". The influence of the colonial powers on missionary activity also varied. In Fujian, the English and American missionaries

established their mission and churches in close cooperation without the overarching control of their respective governments. The denominational histories of the English Presbyterian mission show how, at times, the missionaries worked with the British Consul to establish peace between warring factions among the Chinese. In Formosa (Taiwan), the occupying power was Japan, not Britain. And not insignificantly, Christianity has been growing rapidly and is now an influential minority faith in China.

In Chapter One, “Christus Victor”, Mong sets the wider scene by noting the Portuguese came to Malacca for the “3 Gs”, gold, gospel and glory (p. 11). Similarly, *Pax Britannica* and the American sense of *Manifest Destiny* combined imperialist, commercial and evangelistic aims, all laced with the desire to civilise the peoples they encountered. Mong affirms that not all missionaries were “tools and stooges of imperialism” (p. 25) but the overall effect of the book is critical of the missionary movement. If the reader bears in mind the wider scholarly discussion of the missionary contribution to China, this is a valuable perspective.

Chapter Two, on the relationship between missionaries and the opium trade, describes the ambiguous position in which the missionaries found themselves. They saw the effects of opium and condemned the trade. However, they were able to move freely around China due to the concessions made for the sale of opium. In Mong’s words, “their position shifted between silence, connivance and condemnation” (p. 43).

The next chapters on the uprisings and key missionaries follow the same thesis. Robert Morrison (1782-1834), the first Protestant missionary to China, did not oppose opium per se and believed that Britain had a moral responsibility to help poor nations and bring the enlightenment of the Gospel. James Hudson Taylor (1832-1905) in contrast was more vocal in his opposition to the opium trade although he did not take any political steps towards its abolition.

Chapter Seven throws light on Timothy Richard’s unwillingness to appeal to the British consul for help, even when he had a guaranteed right to do so. Richard was a non-conformist Baptist minister and by theological inclination would have been unlikely to want to take this option. His interest in what we now call interfaith dialogue was decades ahead of its time. Chapter Eight on Pearl S. Buck is an interesting addition in a book on this subject. She certainly saw missionaries as incompetent, intolerant and ineffective. She qualifies for inclusion as the daughter of a missionary and an insightful, critical observer.

Mong concludes with a short survey of China under communism. He notes that China has much to learn from its experience under imperialism. The church must not promote the gospel using political or military means. People will resist the Christian faith if they perceive that they are being coerced in to accepting it, or if the Christian community is associated with an oppressive, dominant military or political power. On the other hand, it is equally wrong to think that the Christian community should oppose oppressive authorities by using political means or military force. Mong argues that the Christian community in China needs to stand up for the Gospel and its values but to do so with integrity, humility and respect for others.

This is a valuable volume on this subject and should be on the reading lists for this topic.

Ambrose Mong is an assistant parish priest at St Theresa's Catholic Church, Hong Kong and research associate at the Chinese University of Hong Kong. He includes much interesting Catholic material and perspectives which is further valuable contribution on the subject.

Reviewed by STUART VOGEL  
Auckland

Claudio Sopranzetti, *Owners of the Map: Motorcycle Taxi Drivers, Mobility and Politics in Bangkok*, Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018, xiv + 314 pp. ISBN 9780520288492 (hbk); 9780520288508 (pbk).

This is a brilliant and rewarding monograph for anyone who wants to understand contemporary Thailand (or indeed, by analogy, other Southeast Asian states), particularly because it delineates in great detail the fracture lines and tensions in Thai politics and society so readily concealed from the visitor to the "Land of Smiles".

Sopranzetti is an anthropologist, not a political scientist, and the core of this book, his second, is an ethnography of Bangkok's multitudinous motorcycle taxi drivers, that cohort of individuals who provide the swiftest ways through the city's notorious traffic jams. He vividly recreates the lives and aspirations of Hong, Adun, Boon, Id, Oboto, Lerm, the twins Yai and Lek, and many others who appear more fleetingly in the pages of the book. The book is dedicated to Lek, who died in 2016.

Motorcycle taxi drivers became an important part of the Bangkok streetscape in the 1980s. Acute traffic conditions and the advent of relatively cheap motor bikes were prerequisites as was a workforce – drawn overwhelmingly from the relatively poor north east ("Isan") – and a favourable regulatory framework (pp. 36-37). The advent of the Skytrain network in 1999, far from putting the drivers out of business, gave them an even more fundamental role in the city's circulatory structure (p. 73) and as was to transpire, a key role in its political turmoil (chapter 7).

The book is much more than an ethnography because Sopranzetti conducted his research at the time motorcycle taxi drivers became deeply involved in that turmoil. The turmoil ultimately led to the military coup of 2014, an outcome Sopranzetti argues was prefigured after street demonstrations had been violently dispersed in May 2010.

The book explains motorcycle driver politicization in the 2000s in the context of the rocky course of Thai politics and society in the new millennium. This bumpy ride is often attributed to multiple but aligned tensions – between metropolis (Bangkok) and the provinces (especially the northeast but also other peripheries); between the professional middle class and the poor; between hierarchical and egalitarian visions of Thailand's present and future.

Sopranzetti very usefully reminds the reader that the populist but wealthy Thaksin Shinawatra became prime minister in February 2001 in the wake of the 1997 Asian financial crisis and *middle class* disillusionment with the IMF-imposed austerity that followed (pp. 121-22, 157). The polarization between "Yellow Shirt" (conservative) and "Red Shirt" (radical-reformist) groupings took place only in 2005/06, when the middle



classes turned against Thaksin's slew of populist policies and his polemics against the privileged including, in what was probably a fatal misstep, the monarchy (pp. 157-62).

How do the motorcycle taxi drivers fit into that story? Sopranzetti explains the rhetoric of "itsaraphap" – autonomy or freedom – that Thaksin deployed to offer motorcycle drivers the opportunity to escape from their status as clients of powerful rent-seeking patrons (often officials) to that of being self-reliant entrepreneurs. Government registration of the drivers, introduced in 2001, was intended to facilitate this. Certainly such initiatives turned the bulk of the drivers into strong supporters of Thaksin and later of the Red Shirt movement. And it led to them playing a critical role in the Bangkok disturbances of March to May 2010, becoming, in one of their leader's words, the 'owners of the map' (p. 197; ironically the maps used to depict this, at pp. 204 and 218 are one of the weakest parts of the book).

In a telling final chapter Sopranzetti explores the tension in the outlook of many motorcycle taxi drivers between supporting the Red Shirt cause and advancing their own sectional interests. This tension became salient in the wake of the suppression of the 2010 protests when some of the leadership of the motorcycle taxi driver association (AMTT) collaborated with the authorities to further enhance the standing of motorcycle taxi drivers: "we are not Reds, we are not Yellows, we are Orange Shirts, the colour of our vests". Many AMTT members were disillusioned by the strategy and membership fell (p. 243, including quote).

Understandably, Sopranzetti argues that a close study of motorcycle taxi drivers calls into question "linear narratives of an opposition between a traditional and paternalistic mode of governance on the one hand and a modern and egalitarian one of the other" (p. 254). Not least, Thaksin's brutal killings in his war on drugs (in 2018 analogy with Duterte in the Philippines is inescapable) and his disastrous handling of the Pattani conflict in southern Thailand were indicative of an authoritarianism as pronounced as that of his adversaries.

Sopranzetti concludes on a note consistent with his immersion in the lives of his protagonists, stressing his allegiance to these "people who zigzag through life striving to survive, to create something better for their children, and to have their demands satisfied, all the while being pulled by the irreconcilable tensions between the shifting logics of capital, the concrete realities of their everyday lives, and the aspirational desires of their political struggles." (p. 256). He overplays his hand in seeing a late capitalism of circulation rather than production being appropriately matched by a mobilization that literally interrupted "circulation". But it is a valid historical as well as normative point to recognize that: "the drivers' actions . . . tell a story of unresolved tensions . . . emerging cracks and fault lines, of collective action that raise significant challenges when aimed at the right spots and of opposing orders striving in vain to impose themselves." (pp. 279-80).

*Reviewed by* MALCOLM McKINNON  
Victoria University of Wellington

Sophie Walker, *The Japanese Garden*, London: Phaidon Press, 2017, 304 pp.  
ISBN 978 0 7148 7477 7 (pbk in hbk casement).

This new volume on gardens of Japan is expansive and diverse in its purvey, and ambitiously presented. Its arrangement is a little unusual: each of its eleven chapters is followed by a cluster of related illustrations and explanatory matter, and these are interspersed again by several brief essays offering the personal reflections of ‘guest’ authors – architects, artists, a mathematician, and a novelist, whose garden sensibilities complement those of Sophie Walker, a garden designer and art historian. The whole makes for a varied read, or invites selective examinations of specific gardens, and their origins, conventions, conceptual foundations, cultural significance, or historical evolution.

Each of the author’s own chapters explores a specific theme. Thus, the ‘The Nature of the Garden’ situates the temporal experience and rich aesthetic, socio-cultural, and even ethical, significance of the ‘well-tended garden’ in Japan against an ethos of quiet humility, attitudes to *shizen* (nature), Shintō traditions and Buddhist sensibilities. ‘Beauty, Terror and Power’ expands on these ideas of reverence for nature, and the tension between the mundane and the sacred, as it situates the emergence of garden design against the social fabric of the urban centres of Nara and Heian-kyō (today’s Kyoto). ‘The Way, Body and Mind’ explores the immersive nature of the garden experience, its arrangements of *roji* (paths) and views, organizational principles and boundaries, and particularly the ways in which “the Japanese garden designer deliberately determines how we experience it, carefully directing the way in which we use and navigate its space” (p. 30). ‘Expanded Understanding’ explores the aesthetic significance of the phenomenon of *shakkei* (borrowed scenery), and ‘Duality and Reflection’ examines the harmonizing, and also transformative, potentials of the tensional duality between ‘balanced opposites’ best known, perhaps, in the ‘yin-yang’ duality of *in-yō*.

‘The Hidden, Implied and Imagined’ expands on the imaginative leaps of *mitate* ‘comparative allusion’ that underpin the suggestive capacities of gardens, their references to natural forms, celebrated landscapes, sacred tenets and markers, or literary or poetic connotations. How gardens like those at Daisen-in or Ryōan-ji that cannot be physically entered or experienced can accommodate refined contemplative, insightful, or imaginative experiences for each viewer is explored in ‘Zen Challenge: The Unenterable Garden’. ‘Time, Space and the Dry Garden’ examines the “conceptually challenging” (p. 182) phenomenon of *karesansui* (*kare*-dry; *san*-mountain; *sui*-water) gardens so distinctively associated with Japan, and especially Kyoto – ‘stone setting’ garden arrangement at its most refined. Reflections on transitional states of liminality in ‘Death, Tea and the Garden’ introduce Walker’s account of the tea garden as *roji*/passage, and the ways garden qualities are guided by Buddhist tenets “of harmony, respect, purity and tranquility” (p. 198). Here also she explores the best known Japanese aesthetic sensibilities: the poignant beauty, humility and imperfection of *wabi-sabi*; the lonely transience of *mono no aware*; and the dark mystery of *yūgen*. ‘Inner Space: The Courtyard Garden’ focuses closely on the emergence of the *tsubo-niwa* courtyard garden

in Heian court life, and the ways they provide private spaces for inner contemplation (p. 223). Flowers are not a universal component of the Japanese garden, but many – the chrysanthemum, lotus or bush clover, for example – make culturally significant allusions. Walker explores this theme of *hanakotoba* “the language of the flower” (p. 242) in her final chapter, ‘The Poetry of Plants’.

Each chapter is generously illustrated with small, mainly colour, photographs, drawings, maps, or diagrams. The thematic groups of double-, full- or half-page illustrations of each of 94 garden examples following each chapter provide comprehensive insights into the ideas explored in the text. Unsurprisingly, 67 of these are of Kyoto gardens; the remainder document gardens from as far north as Hokkaidô, to Kagoshima in the south. They include gardens from as early as 678CE (the Kamigamo jinja), and examples from every subsequent period in Japanese history. The most recent examples, including Tatsuo Miyajima’s 2002 *Time Garden* and the 2014 *Garden of I-Art House* on Inujima Island offer accounts of recent garden design unavailable in other anthologies. The text explanations illuminate themes of gardens as symbolic or sacred sites, places of reflection, meditation, learning, passage or retreat. They explore themes of ‘contrived naturalness’, contemplation, and garden-making conventions, including the virtues of spaciousness, seclusion, ingenuity, antiquity, water, and scenic views.

The seven shorter ‘guest’ essays are interspersed at appropriate points between these sections. Korean-born artist, writer and philosopher Lee Ufan explores the temporal, sensory, physical or contemplative manners of the ways visitors experience gardens. Novelist Tan Twan Eng explores the careful deliberation informing the constructions of nature, the ‘sharing of memories’, and ‘convincing, absorbing artifice’ of the garden designer – and perhaps of the novel writing process also. Japanese artist Tatsuo Miyajima –introduces the *karesansui* dry garden through the imaginative connection-making of “spatial *mitate*” (p. 117). Mathematician Marcus du Sautoy draws on the mathematics of fractals to explain creative plays on scale, allusion and illusion, rule and imaginative invention in garden-making, while architect John Pawson offers an appreciation of the restfulness and profound absorption afforded by pared back environments of minimal, monastic simplicity. Artist Anish Kapoor reflects on Zen meditation in his examination of the ‘paradoxical ungraspability’ of Japanese gardens, and the conditions of immanence, transition and liminality that emerge through the performative, subjective process of experiencing gardens as a coming “into meaning” (p. 197). Architect Tadao Andô acknowledges how his own architectural practices have been conditioned by Japanese appreciations of nature, and the distinctive forms and sensibilities of its varied garden culture that have “etched themselves into [his] unconscious memories” (p. 279). If there is a recurrent thread in these reflective themes, it lies in each author’s recognition of the enriching experience of the subjective, and often subconscious, engagement of each visitor.

Six appendices include a brief essay and extended pictorial glossary of plants, an explanation of Japanese historical periods, and map of garden locations, a glossary of terms, and a selected bibliography. There are also an index, acknowledgements, editorial notes and picture credits.

The text sections in both the essays and the concise pictorial annotations are rich in contextual material. They reveal diverse insights into the socio-culturally significant dimensions of garden making and enjoyment. These are enhanced by explanations of aesthetic sensibilities associated with experiencing Japanese gardens. The breadth and variety of the pictorial examples included here, the concision of their notes, and the multi-dimensional, transcultural amalgam of its essays and sources make for richly informative volume. If the complex threads of commentary seem overwhelmingly non-Japanese, this may reflect an increasingly transcultural currency of culturally specific themes today – evident in the proliferation of Japanese-style gardens in domestic and public places in many parts of the world. The comprehensive picture presented here complements earlier perspectives on the gardens of Japan. Given the astonishing visitation some gardens attract – the crowds at Kiyomizu-dera can amount to a constantly moving procession in season – the extensively illustrated book format can offer readers at least some feeling of a contemplative engagement with its subjects.

Given the broad readership this volume may invite, however, Walker's prose may seem densely formed, sometimes hard to read. Her text is richly illustrated with quotations from both Japanese sources (Kakuzō Okakura, Matsuo Bashō, Jun'ichiro Tanazaki and Musō Soseki) and non-Japanese (Walter Gropius, Bruno Taut, Richard Serra, Bruce Chatwin, or John Cage), for example. Reprehensibly, none of their sources is formally acknowledged in the text itself, only some are actually identified there, and many Western sources are excluded from the bibliography. There are some minor confusions or omissions in the text – Japan was not completely isolated to 1853 (p. 17); the identification of a 1649 garden as Momoyama period (p. 206) is unexplained; who is the unidentified *daimyō* (lord) who commissioned the Yōsui-en in Wakayama? And how, precisely, does the author define the term 'abstract' as it is employed throughout this text? The soft paper is attractive, but it does compromise the clarity of the photographic reproductions. The decorative peephole cover is impressive; it is also clumsy in use, and the volume fell apart before the first reading was completed.

This volume doesn't claim to offer a Japanese insight into the conceptual foundations, histories, principles or practices of garden-making and enjoying in Japan – though it engages with each of these themes. It's inclusions of quotes and reflections by largely non-Japanese garden visitors seems, conversely, a reflection on sympathetic, insightful, personal reflections of 'outsider' encounters with the gardens of Japan, informed by a rich tapestry of contextual matter. This is thus, in many ways, a book about how non-Japanese encounter gardens in Japan. Its multi-dimensional compass does much to explain garden sensibilities however, and avoids oversimplification or essentialist arguments. Instead, in embracing themes of sacred and socio-cultural significance, sensibility and subjective experience, it recognizes the capacities of Japanese garden designs for enhancing aesthetic and social inter-cultural appreciations for an international readership.

*Reviewed by* DAVID BELL  
*University of Otago*

Sandra Wilson, Robert Cribb, Beatrice Trefalt, and Dean Aszkielowicz, *Japanese War Criminals: the politics of justice after the Second World War*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2017, pp. 279 pages, + endnotes, bibliography and index. ISBN 978023-1-179225 (cloth), ISBN 978023-1-542685 (e-book)

Recent years have seen a rise in studies of Japanese war crimes in the English-speaking academy.<sup>1</sup> *Japanese War Criminals* joins the field; it is a rare work of joint effort by four historians based in Australia, each with expertise in the Asia-Pacific War. The book illuminates the lesser known Classes B and C trials of Japanese war criminals, not the better-known Class A trials involving high-profile figures such as General Tōjō Hideki. Classes B and C trials examined so called “conventional” war crimes and crimes against humanity, respectively. At the core of the book is the question of oft-conflicting and competing notions of justice, particularly when all the low- to middle-ranking soldiers could do was to obey the commands of their superiors. Indeed, the authors challenge the historian John Dower’s assertion that the Allies blurred the boundary between justice and politics in the Japanese war trials (11). Instead, the book argues how justice and politics intersected at almost every juncture of the proceedings. The authors present numerous cases of Class B and C trials to demonstrate the complexity of the proceedings and the ethical dilemmas the Allied nations faced.

Unlike the Nuremberg and Tokyo trials that took place in single locations, the Class B and C trials demand careful consideration into specific contexts of the location, time and the actors involved. Seven Allied nations carried out a total of a total of 5,707 suspects in 2,362 trials in their own territories from 1946 to 1951.<sup>2</sup> The trials found 4,524 guilty—varying from the death sentence to prison terms of a few months to life imprisonment. The courts acquitted around 1,000. Around 920 were executed (270 and passim). The book offers a chronological history, and deals with two major themes: the Allied nations’ pursuit of justice, and the political developments surrounding the treatment of the prisoners.

The introduction discusses the foundation of the trials. The Allies were determined to do justice for the victims. The Allies preferred not to punish the whole nation to avert the error of the Versailles settlement, and decided to punish the responsible individuals. For the Japanese, the acceptance of the Potsdam Declaration meant the admission to wartime responsibility, with little knowledge of the ramifications (24).

Chapters 1, 2 and 3 capture the struggle of defining and investigating war crimes, establishing courts, and arresting the suspects. The authors combine macro and micro examples to illustrate the murkiness of proving the guilt of the defendants. The Allied nations operated with limited resources and time. Exacerbating this difficulty was

---

1 Yuma Totani, *The Tokyo War Crimes Trial: The Pursuit of Justice in the Wake of World War II* (2008) and *Justice in Asia and the Pacific Region, 1945-1952: Allied War Crimes Prosecutions* (2015).

2 The seven nations were Australia, China, France, the Netherlands, the Philippines, the United Kingdom, and the United States.

the destruction of evidence by the Japanese in the final days of the war. The lack of evidence aided the defendants' claim of 'following the orders' for the war crimes. How judges interpreted the testimonies and the evidence, and applied the legal principles varied. This inconsistency undermined the credibility of the trials. Chapter 3 discusses war crimes against prisoners-of-war (PoW) and civilians, and raises ambiguous legal questions. Japan did not ratify the Geneva Convention that governed the treatment of PoWs and civilians in captivity. The status of the Koreans and Taiwanese guards—whom the PoWs and civilians in southeast Asia feared and resented the most for their arbitrary violence—blurred the distinction between the victims and the perpetrators. Mutual suspicion between the Westerners and the Japanese cast a shadow over the proceedings. The Westerners doubted the validity of Japanese affidavits for they could not be cross-examined; the Japanese defendants were sceptical of witnesses perjuring to ensure conviction (81).

Case by case the authors highlight the differences in Western and Japanese legal philosophy and practices that played out in the courtroom. It would be erroneous to suggest that the authors court Japanese nationalist sympathisers. A careful reader will readily understand that the inconsistencies in the legal procedures are the results of the failure to set the remit of the trials, and it is those inconsistencies (or the perception thereof) that aid the claim of 'victors' justice'. As well as the questions of high moral principles, the book illustrates the practical difficulties that hindered progress. The Allies had trouble distinguishing names, as many prisoners had the same names (50-52). One name when written with different *kanji* can refer to entirely different individuals. The setting of the trials varied, and that could have affected the atmosphere of the trials and the proceedings. The courthouses the Australians set up in New Guinea were little more than a makeshift structure with a corrugated roof (75).

From Chapter 4 the book turns to the politics of the war criminals. Chapter 4 describes how the emerging Cold War realpolitik undermined the initial humanitarian spirit of demilitarising Japan and serving justice amongst the Allied nations. Whilst the United States was willing to relax its treatment of the war criminals to nurture the Japanese as a new Cold War ally, others, such as Australia and Britain, took a tough stance. As with the chapters on the trials, the authors switch between the big-picture narratives and individual cases to tell the stories. What catches one's mind was the importance of practical concerns, such as the increasing financial burden for conducting the trials. These matters influenced the Allies' judgment on whether imprisonment had achieved the original purposes of the trials, despite the initial resolve to serve justice.

Chapters 5 and 6 detail renewed questions of individual guilt and national responsibility. Japan signed the Peace Treaty and regained its sovereignty in 1952, which meant that clemency for the prisons became a diplomatic issue. The Japanese public sought the repatriation of the prisoners and let them serve the remainders of their sentences in Japan. The differences in the Allies' reactions came to a head over Article 11 of the Peace Treaty agreement. The Article reiterated that Japan accept the ruling by the war trials, but entitled Japan to seek clemency from each of the Allies. This provision stemmed from the disagreement within the Allies over the meaning and the

application of pardon (161-2). Varied responses from the Allies show complicated and conflicting motives and considerations for repatriation, while Sugamo Prison - that held the war criminals – became an anachronistic relic of the war trials.

The concluding chapter ties a number of thematic threads together, and places the Japanese trials in the global picture. It then compares the Japanese trials to the closet cousin, the Nuremberg trials. The authors' position on justice and politics crystallises when they refer to the philosopher Karl Jaspers' meditation on the Nazi past. We learn that the circumstances, resources, evidence and, above all, that the Germans conducted their own trials which made for essential differences between the trials of the two defeated nations. Put differently, the authors believe that both Germany and Japan committed war crimes, but the ways the Allied administered the trials in the two nations created different trajectories to the postwar efforts. Any scholar working on Japan in the English language (or other non-English speaking country) would be aware of the thorny business of keeping abreast with Japanese-language and English-language scholarship and the enormity of bridging the gap between the two realms. This practical issue reveals a minor blemish. The book could have drawn the readers' attention to the roles of the Japanese intellectuals and public opinion, as the works by Japanese scholars, writing in Japanese, such as Yoshida Yutataka, Fukuma Yoshiaki, and Narita Ryūichi can testify.<sup>3</sup>

Having read the book, one remains impressed with the tight unity of the authors for a lucid and coherent narrative, the extensive archival research—both in geographical spread and the depth, and the careful use of secondary sources. The book expects a reader willing to engage in the complexity of the issues within and without the main text. The generous endnotes and the extensive bibliography should serve as a guide for further exploration. These qualities make the book suitable as a foundational text for students and scholars in law, history and international relations. The big-picture history the book provides makes an excellent platform for new enquiry into how individual veterans and civilians, be these Japanese, Allied or the 'colonised subjects', felt about and dealt with the questions of wartime crimes, guilt and victimhood. These are questions of moral ambiguity and post-traumatic stress, whereby the military culture has left indelible scars on victims and perpetrators.

*Reviewed by* RYOTA NISHINO  
*The University of the South Pacific, Fiji*

---

3 Yoshida Yutaka. *Nihonjin no sensōkan: sengoshi no naka no henyō* [Japanese Views of War: Changes during Postwar History] (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 2005); Fukuma Yoshiaki, "*Sensō Taiken*" no sengoshi [A Postwar History of 'War Experience'] (Tokyo: Chūō Kōron, 2009); Narita Ryūichi, 'Sensō keiken' no sengoshi: katarareta taiken / shogen / kioku [A postwar history of 'war experience': spoken experience, testimonies and memory] (Tokyo: Iwanami shoten, 2010).

Jie Zhao, *Brush, Seal and Abacus: Troubled Vitality in Late Ming China's Economic Heartland, 1500-1644*, Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 2018, xv + 267 pp. ISBN: 978-962-996-776-5 (hbk.)

Early in her book (p. 29), Jie Zhao mentions a visit that Huang Zongxi (1610-1695) 黃宗羲 paid in 1664 on Qian Qianyi 錢謙益 (1583-1664) at his Mountain Hut that Brushes the Water (Fushui shanfang 拂水山房) residence in Changshu. Once the preeminent literary figure of his age and an important official besides, Qian's circumstances have become somewhat reduced; the dynasty he had served, the Ming (1368-1644), had fallen, replaced by the Qing (1644-1911), to which he had quickly surrendered, earning himself lasting opprobrium, and then in 1650 the library that he had built for his new young wife Liu Rushi 柳如是 (1618-1664), the Tower of the Crimson Clouds (Jiangyun lou 絳雲樓), had caught fire, reducing its exquisite collection of some 3000 Song dynasty imprints to ashes. Now on his deathbed and reliant upon the income derived from his pen, Qian turns to the younger man for help:

He...told me that a Salt Commissioner Gu had asked him to write three essays on his behalf, offering the emolument of a thousand *taels* each for them, and that although he had previously asked someone else to undertake the task for him, what had been produced "Had not accorded at all with my views, which circumstance made me aware that only you could undertake the task for me". I wished to somewhat delay the task at hand, but Qian was insistent, and he had me led into his study and the door was locked behind me. The first essay was to be entitled "Tomb Inscription for Gu Yunhua (Fengweng)" ("Gu Yunhua Fengweng muzhi" 顧雲華封翁墓誌), the second "Preface to *Gu Yunhua's Poetry Collection*" ("*Yunhua shi xu*" 雲華詩序), and the third "Preface to an *Annotated Edition of the Book of Master Zhuang*" ("*Zhuangzi zhu xu*" 莊子註序). As I needed to be elsewhere urgently, I set to my writing task immediately and, by the second watch of the night, had completed it. Qian then had someone make large-character copies of my essays, which he then proceeded to read as he lay on his bed, bowing in gratitude to me once he had done so.<sup>1</sup>

Zhao's book finishes, too, with a glimpse of Qian Qianyi, at a slightly earlier moment in his life (1660), as he roots around with his cane amongst the rubble of what had once been his friend Zou Diguang's 鄒迪光 (1550-1626) Valley of the Foolish Old Man (Yugong gu 愚公谷) garden on the slopes of Mount Hui in Wuxi. "Whenever I pass by [Zou Diguang's] garden, I call to mind my earlier tours of the place; where now are the Hall of Heaven's Uniformity or the Belvedere of the Radiance of the Stupa,

---

1 Huang Zongxi, *Recollecting My Friends of Old* (*Si jiu lu* 思舊錄), in Shen Shanhong 沈善洪, ed., *Huang Zongxi quanji* 黃宗羲全集 [The Complete Works of Huang Zongxi] (Hangzhou: Zhejiang guji chubanshe, 2005), Vol. 1, p. 378; my translation.



within which we once handed cups to each other as we composed our poems, for all those places where we then passed our days and spent our nights seem suddenly to have been reduced to blackened ash and red dirt? (余每過彥吉園亭回首昔游天均之堂塔光之榭往者傳杯度曲移日分夜之處胥化為黑灰紅土),” Qian turns to his companion to remark. “Like broken dreams buried in ash, so very distantly removed now is that world of yore that it cannot readily be regained” (灰沉夢斷迢然不可復即矣).<sup>2</sup>

Zhao employs the first of these occasions to broach one of the main themes of her monograph: the extent to which the rapidly changing economic conditions of the late-Ming moment were altering the circumstances for (and the relationships between) the three shifting and overlapping groups of scholar, scholar-official, and merchant, the “Brush, Seal and Abacus” of her title, and the corrosive effect of money on pre-existing status relationships of one sort or another. The latter anecdote, to her mind, illustrates something of the “dynastic collapse and social chaos” that was the “sorrowful dénouement” (p. 10) of such developments.

Indeed, this late-Ming moment (conventionally dated from the middle of the sixteenth century until the middle of the seventeenth) proved a most unsettling time for China’s ruling elites. As has been outlined in previous secondary work, rapid and asymmetrical economic developments,<sup>3</sup> fuelled by the growth of commodity markets and the monetization of silver, served to undermine existing status relationships and led to higher levels of urbanization and social mobility. The commercialized publishing industry fed off and into an expansion of literacy and educational opportunity and a flourishing popular culture that displayed a greater willingness to question Neo-Confucian orthodoxies. To contemporaries, accompanying such socioeconomic changes were those age-old and unmistakable tokens of dynastic decline; at the upper levels, incompetent and extravagant emperors, the expansion of eunuch power, factionalism and corruption at court, and the empire’s increasingly obvious inability to deal effectively with threats, both internal and external, to the political order; at the local

- 
- 2 Qian Qianyi, “Shao Qianfu shiji xu” 邵潛夫詩集序 [Preface to Shao Qianfu’s Collection of Poetry], in Qian Zhonglian 錢仲聯 ed., *Qian Muzhai quanji* 錢牧齋全集 [The Complete Works of Qian Qianyi] (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2003), Vol. 5, p. 812; again, my translation. In his own account of the design of his garden, “Record of the Valley of the Foolish Old Man” (“Yugonggu sheng” 愚公谷乘), Zou Diguang says of this first feature named here that, in contrast to the small scale and simplicity of its other structures, this hall was large and well-appointed (*huanwei fengchang* 環瑋豐敞) and could seat up to twenty people at a time, sitting facing out over the Soak of the Jade Lotus (Yuhejin 玉荷浸), for which see Chen Zhi 陳植 and Zhang Gongchi 張公馳, eds., *Zhongguo lidai mingyuan ji xuanzhu* 中國歷代名園記選注 [Famous Chinese Garden Records Down Through the Ages: Selected and Annotated] (Hefei: Anhui kexue jishu chubanshe, 1983), p. 190.
  - 3 Zhao illustrates something of the extent to which the circumstances of the time allowed the rich to become vastly richer: “In Songjiang, for instance, until the end of the fifteenth century, the property of an official family had been, on average, about ten times larger than that of a commoner. This ratio was since rendered utterly obsolete by the rapid growth of officials’ wealth, amounting to hundreds of thousands and even millions of silver taels” (p. 66).

level, ever increasing conspicuous consumption on the one hand, causing often violent outbreaks of social unrest, and local gentry attempts to alleviate the obvious signs of social breakdown through charitable activities of one sort or another. The collapse, when it finally came in the form of peasant rebellion followed by “barbarian” invasion, proved one of the most dramatic and cataclysmic in Chinese history.<sup>4</sup>

Before the collapse, the disordered circumstances of the times induced among the Chinese literati intense anxieties about self-definition and worth, status, learning and money. Following the collapse and the establishment of Manchu authority, men such as Qian Qianyi and Huang Zongxi were faced with more acute choices concerning those most quintessential of Confucian virtues, courage, loyalty, and righteousness. In the case of these two friends, for instance, the facts that they decided upon proved to be diametrically opposed.

To this discourse of political deadlock and economic laissez-faire, Zhao brings the useful prism of the “troubled vitality” of the Six Prefectures (*liu fu* 六府) of Changzhou, Suzhou, Songjiang, Huzhou, Jiaxing, and Hangzhou, south of the Yangtze River and half-encircling, to the east, Lake Tai along the course, largely, of the Grand Canal. Citing the contemporary concerns of men such as the prominent Changshu scholar Zhao Yongxian 趙用賢 (1535-1596) (and noted book collector) about the centrality of the Six Prefectures to the well-being of the empire as a whole and the worrying signs of social dislocation, Zhao paints a detailed picture of the various webs of power and influence established and maintained by the elites of this region, both locally and nationally, in the advancement of their own family and regional interests. She is particularly good when she deals with the specifics of the ways and means employed by people of the time to evade taxation. By the critical decade of 1583-1593, however, during the long reign of the Wanli emperor (1563-1620; r. 1572-1620) and after the death of the Senior Grand Secretary Zhang Juzheng 張居正 (1525-1582), by common contemporary and later consensus, circumstances had so deteriorated that far from being able to uphold the economic wherewithal of empire, the Six Prefectures themselves were hostage to the many and various prevailing man-made and natural disasters, like a sinking ship or a smouldering fire under a pile of wood, in contemporary parlance.

A number of relatively minor issues detract somewhat from Zhao’s otherwise excellent treatment of a period of history that has occasioned considerable recent interest, both popular and academic in both China and in the West, as much, perhaps, for any possible economic and political parallels with contemporary circumstances in China as for its own considerable intrinsic interest and significance. The first is the number of typographical errors of one sort or another perpetrated, and the occasional lapse of the appropriate register for an academic monograph. Another is that, judging from the bibliography, much of the research for this volume appears to have been

---

4 For highly readable treatments of these issues, see Timothy Brook, *The Confusions of Pleasure: Commerce and Culture in Ming China* (Berkeley, Los Angeles & London: University of California Press, 1999); and the same author’s more recent *The Troubled Empire: China in the Yuan and Ming Dynasties* (Cambridge, Mass. & London: Harvard University Press, 2010).

undertaken almost a decade ago; the latest publication date I spotted was 2010. This means that the book fails to benefit from some of the more recent relevant scholarship. Despite the focus on charity in Chapter VI, for instance, Zhao fails to make any use of Joanna Handlin Smith's excellent *The Art of Doing Good: Charity in Late Ming China* (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 2009).<sup>5</sup> Finally, despite Zhao Jie's explicit intention to "...let the people of the past speak for themselves, to tell their stories on their own terms, with a minimum of theorizing, and to recapture some of the flavour of the region's richly textured social and cultural life" (xiv), her book seems strangely leached of much of the cultural interest and specificity that serve to define the age. Much of the important and telling circumstantial detail of the two occasions with which Zhao bookends her work, as discussed above, for instance, and which floats into our awareness when we attend carefully to the written legacy of this generation of scholar, is left out of her account. A pity. For cultural historians, details matter, as do contexts.

*Reviewed by* DUNCAN M. CAMPBELL  
Victoria University of Wellington

Yangwen Zheng ed., *Sinicizing Christianity*, Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2017, xiii+ 376, pp. ISBN 9789004330382 (E-book).

*Sinicizing Christianity* is a welcome addition to our knowledge of the ways in which Christianity is becoming embedded within modern Chinese society and culture. The three parts and ten chapters of the work outline the processes that are at work in shifting Christianity (or as is implicit throughout the book, "Christianities") away from Western forms of theological expression and church leadership and developing new and distinctively Chinese models.

In his lengthy introduction, Zheng Yangwen notes the three key elements in the volume: 1. "The Chinese agents of sinicization", 2. "The Chinese redefinition of Christianity for the local context", and 3. "Chinese institutions and practices that emerged and enabled sinicization". In other words, the emphasis in this volume is on how Chinese Christians have acquired and understood their faith. The authors then look at the ways that they have adapted it and re-expressed it in uniquely Chinese terms. Chinese Christians have then articulated it *in* and *for* the contemporary social, historic and political circumstances in which they have found themselves.

An underlying issue is what is meant and implied by the title "Sinicizing Christianity". Today one might expect a title such as "Contextualising Christianity in China". The difference between the two titles is significant. In the discussion about "contextualisation", Christianity is understood to be a universal faith whose

---

5 Joanna F. Handlin Smith's earlier "Gardens in Ch'i Piao-chia's Social World: Wealth and Values in Late-Ming Kiangnan", *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 51.1 (1992): 55-81, too, would have been relevant to the various themes of this present work.

“fundamental truths” are universally the same in all times and all places. Those truths are, however, continually and necessarily being re-expressed in the languages and expressions of new contexts. The hope is that in each context the Christian faith will be presented in intelligible, articulate and culturally appropriate ways. That intention is that a Christian church will grow in China and become a valued member of the worldwide Christian family of Churches, united in Christ.

The phrase “Sinicizing Christianity” might, however, suggest the reverse process: that the Christian faith is itself converted to being primarily, in this context, a Chinese religion. This volume helpfully raises, but does not resolve, the question as to whether Christianity can be both a universal faith and a “sinicized” faith at the same time. Behind such a question lies the further question as to what the unchanging, fundamental Christian truths are.

Part One, “Agents of Introduction and Enculturation”, describes how Chinese Christians have attempted to discern and determine their own ways of interpreting and living out their Christian faith. This chapter raises the dilemmas that Chinese Christians find themselves in, when the “universal” and “local contextual” perspectives collide.

In Chapter One, “A Mission without Missionaries: Catholic Clergy in Sichuan 1746-1756”, Robert Entenmann draws on the diaries of two Chinese priests who carried out their mission in the absence of foreign priests who had been forced to leave the area. In those 10 years, the Chinese priests were essentially autonomous. They integrated their knowledge of Chinese society with their dedication to maintaining the integrity of Catholic doctrine and canon law. They made decisions based on their own pastoral and theological judgments. They granted, for example, dispensation for Catholics to marry non-Catholics, which was quite against the Catholic law at the time. When the European priests returned, they chastised the Chinese priests and imposed their understanding of strict adherence to canon law. As a result, Chinese priests in Sichuan were not appointed to the leadership position of vicars apostolic in 1929.

Chapter Two, “The Role of Union Theological Seminary (New York) in Sinicizing Christianity” by Christopher D. Sneller and Chapter Three, “‘Taking Jesus back to China’: New Gospel Agents in Shanghai” by Yuqin Hwang, discuss how Chinese students and scholars overseas encountered, understood and adapted the Christian faith in order to address their own concerns. Sneller shows how the Union theological College in New York impacted on Chinese students who converted to Christianity in the USA and who then returned to Shanghai. Union Seminary was a bastion of liberal and social theology and it provided a questioning theological framework, which sought ways to accommodate the Christian faith to the needs of modernity and modern societies. The experience of being at Union Seminary encouraged students to assess and adapt their faith to China and its issues. Union Seminary gave them “theological permission”, so to speak, to adapt and interpret their Christian faith in relation to developments at home. Yuqin Huang writes of the returnees to China, “The Chinese have understood Christianity in terms of their own concerns and experiences, and therefore Chinese Christianity has been the story of indigenous appropriation rather than external imposition” (p. 83).

Parts Two is entitled “Redefining Christianity in the Chinese Context”. The chapters in this section show how Chinese Christians sought to not only to make Christianity *intelligible* to their people but also *useful*. Christianity had to offer people something they perceived themselves to need. Chapter Five, “Sermon, Song and Story in the inculturation of Christianity in China” by Thomas Alan Harvey, focuses on the sermons of well-known and well-documented Chinese preachers, Wang Mingdao and John Sung and on the hymns of Jian Dianying. He develops the argument that: “through sermon, testimony and song, that message [of the Christian gospel] was made accessible to common people in a manner practical to daily life and the challenges faced. Wang’s sermons provided biblical scaffolding to understand and respond to events impacting the Churches in China” (p. 161).

Chapter Six, “Translating and Transplanting the Word of God in to Chinese” by Monica Romano, is an excellent summary of the history of the translation of the Bible by Protestant and Catholic scholars. Romano also includes a discussion of the translation of the Catholic liturgy and of Protestant translations in to Chinese vernaculars, such as Hokkien. She concludes with a summary of the issues associated with joint Catholic and Protestant translations. This cooperation collapsed due to the inability to resolve fundamental issues relating to the interpretation of both the Bible and how to express its message in Chinese terms.

Part Three “Building and Singing the Christian Faith” focuses on how Christian architecture and music have reflected the inculturation of the “Christianities” in China. Chapter Seven, “The Sino-Christian Style: A Major Tool for Architectural Indigenization” by Thomas Coomans, and Chapter Nine, “The Sinicization of Sacred Music: A Study of T. C. Chao” by Dennis T.W. Ng, give a full explanation of the importance and impact of the adaptation and Sinicization of architecture and music. However, those with some acquaintance with the Church in China will feel dissatisfied at this point. Most of the Church buildings in China were built in classic Western architectural style. The hymns sung in them, even today are often translations of nineteenth century, Western European Protestant hymns.

Clearly there are “Christianities” in China, which express different theological and liturgical understandings of the Christian faith. These seek to address or respond to current social and political issues in various ways. These “Christianities” also display understandings and degrees of “sinicization” and in fact some Christians may choose to reject Chinese culture and state. More research needs to be done on how the breadth and impact of Sinicization in modern China and the ongoing influence of westernised forms of faith with Christian communities there.

In the final chapter, “Epilogue: Multiple Sinicizations of Multiple Christianities”, Richard Madsen places the findings of the volume back in the dilemma raised in the beginning of this review. What is universally the same and what is legitimately localised? Madsen identifies the different dimensions of Catholicism in China, such as the “underground”, the “official church”, the ongoing role of the Vatican. He notes to the indigenization of local leadership of the Church from its beginning and the strong sense of Marian devotion which is underlaid with the influence of Chinese

folk religion and emphasis on miraculous healings. This leads to conflict with a centralised authority which seeks to bring an acceptable order. He concludes: "The point here is that in various contexts Chinese Catholicism has become as much a localised communal folk religion as a world religion. But it is never purely one or the other. There is always an interplay between the different dimensions of the religion and which one is salient at any given time is always a matter of specific cultural and historic circumstances" (p. 322).

*Reviewed by* STUART VOGEL

*Auckland*

# EAST ASIAN HISTORY



*East Asian History*, published twice yearly (June and December), provides refereed articles on subjects of historical significance in East Asia, and issues of contemporary concern and sub-regions of Asia. Articles on art, architecture, technology, the environment, the history of ideas, emotions and subjective experience, are also welcome.

*"East Asian History has come to occupy a very special place in the field, thanks to its unusually high production values, its stylish look, and above all its consistent showcasing of high-quality work. I have grown accustomed to expecting to find in each new issue at least one provocative essay that makes me rethink completely something I thought I knew about East Asia – and I am almost never disappointed"*

Jeffrey N. Wasserstrom, Indiana University

*"East Asian History is that rare publication in Asian studies: scholarly, readable, fascinating, informative, and highly visual. It brings together topics covered nowhere else – the order of birds in Dunhuang, Hedda Morrison and Sven Hedin in Jehol, Japan and China as represented in early Australian theatre, Japanese colonial archaeology in Korea – and pairs them with visual images that both elucidate the texts and stand alone as historical documentation. East Asian History gives readers in-depth insights into worlds previously unknown to them. It captivates, fascinates, and educates."*

Raymond Lum, Asian Bibliography Harvard College Library, Harvard University

Articles should first be submitted in either in hard copy or electronic format for consideration to:

The Editor, *East Asian History*, Division of Pacific and Asian History, Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies,  
Australian National University, Canberra ACT 0200, Australia

Phone: +61-2-6125 3140 Fax: +61-2-6125 5525 E-mail Enquiries: [marion@coombs.anu.edu.au](mailto:marion@coombs.anu.edu.au)

## BECOME A SUBSCRIBER

Australia A\$50 (including GST)

International US\$45 (GST free)

Please charge my

☐ Bankcard

☐ Mastercard

☐ Visa

☐ AMEX

with the sum of: AU\$/US\$ \_\_\_\_\_

Card Expiry: \_\_\_\_\_

Card No.:

Cardholder's Name (Please Print): \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Cardholder's Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_



THE AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY

Upon payment this becomes a tax invoice ABN 52 234 063 90