Globalisation: Locating Bali and Balinese Music

Globalisation has been made much of in scholarly discourses in recent years. Whether it is Ritzer’s (2000) discussion of McDonaldization, Bryman’s (1995) exploration of Disneyization, or Appadurai’s (1996) idea of “scapes”, academics have increasingly brought to the forefront of intellectual debate discussion of the phenomenal increase of global flows and their subsequent effects on peoples. Such an extraordinary growth globally in the movement of people, objects, and concepts, together with the complex ways this might be understood within and across cultures, challenges perceptions about the location of culture and identity formation outside preconceived notions of cultural place (see also Bhabha 1994).

Performance or consumption of a culture’s music is not limited to the inhabitants or migrants of that culture, but is increasingly part of an array of artifacts readily consumed within globalised culture. Since the mid-1980s, the boom in the world music industry has impacted on Balinese music (usually gamelan - there are over twenty genres in Bali alone – and kecak, or the Monkey chant, as it has so often been called). The world music industry has of course impacted on many other musics, but it is Balinese music that is used here to illustrate one culture that has often been foregrounded more than others. As one example of many, it is disseminated and consumed in many global contexts: it is played by amateurs and professionals in Bali; by visiting

---

1 Henry Johnson (henry.johnson@stonebow.otago.ac.nz) is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Music, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand. His research focuses on the music and performing arts of Japan, Indonesia, and India, with particular reference to the place of traditional music in contemporary society.


3 See Tenzer (1991) for a further examination of some gamelan genres, together with references to more in-depth studies.
tourists to Bali; in the world music industry (recorded and live); by amateurs and professionals outside Bali (non-Balinese and Balinese in, for example, Japan, New Zealand, the United Kingdom, and the United States of America); and it is even found in a plethora of other places that depict images of Bali, including many scholarly or non-scholarly texts (see Picard 1996:16-38). Such contexts surely extend the location of Bali and provoke a wider conceptualisation of cultural place without limiting it to geographic boundaries. Furthermore, the study of music that transcends a national, regional, or cultural boundary raises questions about the contradictions of studying people making music who imagine its origin, but play it outside its original context. Music provides a referential geographic location in terms of the ways its players conceptualise and behave in connection with it. Music often references a cultural home, but the people making it are not always located in the same place as that which the music references. With any flow of people there will surely be a movement of music and perceived origins of that music, but the growing impact of globalisation on music increasingly allows the immediate consumption of a music that is far removed from one’s illusory own.

An inherent aspect of any global flow is the meeting of cultures. Exposure to a cultural ‘other’, whether explicit or implicit, or within one’s perceived culture or not, is a part of contemporary global society where the consumption of cultural ‘otherness’ is very often part of everyday life. Tourism, or travel (the two terms are often used synonymously), and the ‘world music’ industry (that is musics of the world – usually non-western, or western folk – marketed for consumption within and across national and cultural borders) are very much connected with the idea of globalisation. The consumption of cultural soundscapes as part of a musical ‘other’ within the tourist industry raises questions about the ways music is used both in performances for tourists – where it has found an important place in cultural representation – and in performances of a musical ‘other’ by musicians outside that music’s perceived home. Indeed, some Balinese music traditions, like so many other world musics, are consumed in many ways in many places. It is here, under the influence of tourism and globalisation, that they have often been invented or reinvented to provide a place for cultural presentation and representation of an ‘other’, whether within or outside Bali.

Balinese performing arts are often used to represent Balinese culture. Wherever the images (for example in tourist brochures, scholarly texts, or live), one will undoubtedly confront Balinese performing arts that have been

---

4 Several universities outside Indonesia employ Indonesian musicians as part of world music or ethnomusicology programmes. See www.gamelan.org.
5 Whether it is African drumming in Australia, Japanese *taiko* drumming in America (see Terada 2000), or Balinese gamelan performance in Europe, each is a product of a type of musical excursion that exists within and across cultures.
6 On the study of invented traditions see especially Hobsbawm and Ranger (1983).
7 See also Hitchcock, King and Parnwell (1993:12-16) in connection with images of the exotic. Cohen (1993) too looks at touristic images of native people. Images of Bali have been produced by some of the island’s long-term residents, for example painter Walter Spies (1895-1942) and composer Colin McPhee (1900-1964).
packaged for consumption in a range of contexts, in an ever-increasing industry of cultural ‘otherness’. This paper explores the presentation and representation of Balinese performing arts inside and outside Bali. It is concerned primarily with music traditions that have been invented at home (that is, in Bali) in connection with tourism, and abroad (outside Bali) in connection with globalisation. While looking at the broad influences of tourism on Balinese performing arts, the study will also discuss the place of Bali in the world music industry. The historical and contemporary globalisation of Bali and its music provokes questions about its place as a geographic location. For example: Where is Balinese music? Where should it be studied? Is music tourism located only in Bali? Should the researcher look globally?

The paper explores Balinese music and cultural tourism firstly in Bali itself, as a way of understanding the importance of music in such contexts today. In this part of the discussion Balinese music is explored in terms of its tourist element along a continuum of music solely for tourists at one end and music that tourists might, but seldom, encounter at the other. Balinese music is introduced here in order to illustrate the ways some of its styles have been invented and reinvented at home and abroad in connection with the influences of tourism and globalisation. Balinese music is very much part of the tourist industry where performances are put on especially for mass tourism, which permeates not only such popular tourist resorts as Kuta and Sanur, but also the cultural centre of Ubud and other towns and villages. In these areas tourists are provided with a wealth of opportunities to listen to various types of music put on especially for them, which are often performed as accompaniment to dance or drama, in a way that places music and performance at the heart of cultural entertainment for tourists, and often providing a source of income for the entertainers and those connected with the tourist industry.

For the music researcher, these contexts provide windows into Bali where one can see not only the importance of music in performance, but also by analysing such contexts, understand its inherent place as part of contemporary Balinese culture. The discussion then moves to the topic of locating Balinese music. It is here that the concept of globalisation (gloBALIsation) is used further in order to show that Bali is not only at home in the Republic of Indonesia, but it is also abroad in the form of both music objects and the imagination.

---

8 Ubud is a cultural centre (see Picard 1996:83-89), where performance is packaged as a product for tourist consumption.

9 “Groups engaged to perform in hotels are usually hired for a set fee . . . . The performers end up with very little in their pockets - normally less than US $1 per performance – but the steadiness of the work does provide a supplement to whatever other sources of income they have” (Tenzer 1991:123). See also Picard (1996:139), who comments on the distribution of income among some performers at tourist shows. McKean (1989) includes a study of the economics of Balinese tourism and what he calls cultural involution.

10 Picard (1996:20-23) talks of the Balinisation of Bali as a way of showing the building of an image of Bali in terms of preserving culture and promoting it through tourism. This introductory section is entitled “GloBALIsation” as a way of illustrating the importance
analyse where tourism/travel is located in connection with musical excursions by non-Balinese performers and listeners.

In December 1994 and January 1995 I stayed in Bali as an ethnomusicologist with the objective of learning the gamelan genre *gong kebyar*. I had already studied and performed this genre in the United Kingdom for three years at Dartington College of Arts, which purchased an ensemble in the 1970s. My previous studies of gamelan *gong kebyar* had been primarily through British music educators, although visiting Balinese musicians did contribute on some occasions. My aim was to learn the music in its cultural context from leading Balinese musicians. I was studying music and people making music in a context I perceived to be the music’s home. During my stay in Bali I was astounded by the amount of public music performances (including many performing arts). The region I stayed in, Peliatan/Ubud, often had several performances in any one day/night that seemed to be put on specifically for tourists. Indeed, it was the performances for tourists that fascinated me. Nightly bus loads of tourists would in an instant fill the area; cameras would flash continuously; many people were holding video cameras; and performers and audience alike seemed to be extremely satisfied with the cultural event. All the performances I attended charged an entrance fee and provided programme notes in English.\(^{11}\) During my time in Bali, and soon after, many questions were raised by such performances: Why was music so integral to tourism? How did this affect the music or music meanings? How did the tourist performance influence images of Bali outside Bali? How did my previous knowledge of Balinese music affect what I was doing during fieldwork? Is there really a need to travel to Bali to learn Balinese music? The following discussion is not a summary of all things Balinese, inside and out. But, rather, Balinese music is used as the focus in order to explore not only its place in touristic Bali, but also how its study can challenge ways of studying, locating, and defining a field. It is a study of the interconnectedness of local Bali and global Bali – glocal Bali.

**Balinese Music and Tourism**

Tourism is integral to contemporary Bali.\(^{12}\) The island has been described as “one of the world’s foremost playgrounds” (Payne 1993:57).\(^{13}\) The first

---

11 Picard (1990) has reproduced several such programme notes.
12 See especially Picard (1996) for a comprehensive overview of much about tourism in Bali.
13 On economic aspects of Bali’s tourist industry see for example Nuryanti (2001). Indonesian tourism figures are noted in Payne (1993:49-60), which helps show the remarkable growth of this industry in the region at this time. In connection with Bali, globalisation and tourism see also, for example, Sofield (2001).
tourist hotel, the Bali Hotel, was established in 1928 in Denpasar,\textsuperscript{14} and the development of tourism in Indonesia with Bali as the central focus was pioneered particularly in the early 1970s with the help of the World Bank.\textsuperscript{15} With a land mass less than 0.3 per cent of the whole of Indonesia, a population of nearly three million, and being just 180 kilometers long by 80 kilometers wide, Bali’s “renown is [certainly] disproportionate to its size” (Picard 1996:11). In recent years Bali more or less survived the financial and political problems found elsewhere in Indonesia and Southeast Asia in the late 1990s. It is a destination that embodies ideas of paradise, ‘otherness’, and culture, and does much to provoke images based on its single most touristic concern, cultural tourism (see further Picard 1993). Of course, this might all change after the bombing of October 2002.

Much has been written about tourism and Bali. Within many of these studies discussion of the performing arts and music is often inherent due to the predominant use of the arts in Balinese cultural tourism. Dunbar-Hall (2001), for instance, has shown the importance of Balinese music and dance in understanding its boundaries and frontiers in cultural tourism. His work includes several case studies outlining the performance genres kecak, calonarang (a dance drama with gamelan), and odalan (a temple ceremony often with music and dance). The study investigates the change in meaning in the transplantation of context, and Dunbar-Hall articulates that “in most situations, the participation of tourists as the audiences at these events is a superficial interaction, a sampling of music and dance in condensed representations and bounded by momentariness” (2001:175). In addition he argues that “in this way, they [tourists] are collaborators in, and at times the instigators of, cultural change and development” (ibid.). In connection with Bali’s development of cultural tourism, Picard (1993 and 1996), for example, has done much to outline its history and question is current situation. Many Balinese performing arts are today sites where the complexities of presentation and representation show much about the power of cultural performance and the ways performance function can change over a relatively short period of time under the immediate influence of culture contact and imported economic dependency. More specifically, Picard (1996:134-163) outlines in detail the significance of Balinese dance as a tourist attraction.

Music is alive and flourishing in Bali (Tenzer 1991). While scholars such as Tenzer note the diverse non-Balinese influences on Bali in that many young Balinese “are perhaps less aware than ever of the history and diversity of their own music” (1991:111), there is still a profound amount of music making on the island. Indeed, some of the many genres of Balinese gamelan, for example, as perhaps the most widespread type of ensemble on the island, have undergone many changes in recent years (Tenzer 1991:109-11). Competitions are very important and were initiated from the 1930s and 1940s (Tenzer

\textsuperscript{14} Tourism in Bali dates from 1924, even though travelers did visit before this time (Picard 1996:24).

\textsuperscript{15} For a study of Javanese perceptions of tourism and performance see Hughes-Freeland (1993).
1991:110) and, as Tenzer points out “the atmosphere at these events is much more reminiscent of a sporting event than a concert. . . . The audiences are thoroughly responsive to everything taking place in the music or dance, reacting instantaneously with approving cheers at a particularly well-executed passage, or jeering with abandon at the slightest mistake” (ibid.). Furthermore, “the 20th century saw an expansion of performance contexts, in particular with secular performances on proscenium stages. The art centre Werdi Budaya, opened in 1976, is a frequent venue for STSI [a college of performing arts in Denpasar] students and faculty, for tourist performances and for the annual Bali Arts Festival” (Gold 2001:290). Events such as these are usually far removed from the tourist industry, but their mention here helps to show the diversity of music making outside the music events that are the ones mostly embedded in the minds and ears of visiting tourists. Moreover, the extent to which gamelan plays a part in everyday Balinese life is emphasised by Roberts (1998:205) who comments that gamelan “has been fully integrated into the modern Indonesian mediascape. Performances of gamelan music are regularly broadcast on Indonesian radio and television, and gamelan is ubiquitous in everyday media culture, from advertising to fashion shows. It also plays a key role in attracting foreign visitors to the country”.

Recontextualisation and Cultural Shows

Tourism has influenced many musics of the world (see for example Cunningham 1998, DeWitt 1999a and 1999b, International Council for Traditional Music 1988, Stokes 1999, and Tatar 1987). Tourism can be seen to influence both change and non-change. Change in the sense that either new structures are devised or old ones are adapted to suit the tourist market or tastes, and non-change in that sometimes traditions are adhered to so that tourist performances become fossilised events that on the one hand represent an idealised Bali, and on the other hand hinder change. The impact of tourism on Bali, with its increased flows of non-Balinese people into and out of the island, is an ethnoscape that has had a profound effect on some genres and contexts of music performance (see Appadurai 1996).16 An analogy can be made in connection with western music influences around the world, and the ethnomusicologist Bruno Nettl (1978:130), for example, has suggested several “responses ... as exhibited in the musical artifacts produced in non-Western societies:” abandonment, impoverishment, preservation, diversification, consolidation, reintroduction, exaggeration, satire, syncretism, westernisation, modernisation (see also Kartomi 1981; Kartomi and Blum 1994; and Nettl 1983:345-54; 1985; 1996).17 It is responses such as these, and others, that are at the heart of the recontextualisation or (re)invention of some genres of

16 See also Minca’s (2000) study of tourism in Bali in connection with spatial divisions.
17 The idea of preserving culture was promoted by the Dutch who “instituted a policy of preservation of Balinese culture and opened Bali to the first Western tourists” (Gold 2001:290; see also Picard 1996).
Balinese music as a direct result of the impact of tourism on the island (see also Yamashita 1992). As Terada (2000:online) has noted:

Many of these [Balinese] performing arts were created for European and American tourists in the 1930s when the colonial government recognized the importance of traditional culture in luring tourists and creating an image of the Dutch as benevolent rulers who protected the cultures of the colonized instead of destroying them. While this revelation may be disappointing to those who seek authenticity, the hybrid music created for tourism has become for Indonesia both a means of introducing its culture to the rest of the world and a source of national identity.

The music in this sense is perceived as traditional.\(^\text{18}\) The tourist consumer and local producer is seeking some kind of nostalgic meaning where the music is imagined to contain some sort of authenticity without traces of explicit westernisation or modernisation (see Brennan 1999). It is invented as a quixotic traditional music in that it embodies the cultural elements that allow it to be distinguished vis-à-vis an imaginary non-traditional music. When tourists gaze (see Urry 1990) and performers represent, they both want a consume traditional genres, thus locals invent, reinvent, and preserve ideals of imagined, characteristic forms (see also Hitchcock, Stanley, and Siu 1997). What the tourist performances represent are often presentations of an idealised Balinese traditional music in a type of living museum that is imagined in both the minds of the performers and the audience (see Anderson 1991). Just as Witzleben (2002) points out that Hong Kong re-imagined itself through the handover ceremonies of 1997, so too do Balinese musicians in their recontextualised performance contexts. Tourist destinations, such as the ones described by MacCannell (2001:382), become increasingly homogenous, tourists increasingly seeking the real or authentic, “a kind of antitourism”.

Gamelan can be heard in diverse contexts in Bali (for example from temples to hotels). Balinese dance – including music and other performing arts - is certainly a major tourist attraction (Picard 1996:134-163). Ensembles are also heard on television and sometimes “include Western drum-kits or synthesizers” (Roberts 1998:205).\(^\text{19}\) Also, gamelan are usually found in one form or another at large tourist hotels “either as an accompaniment to dance performances or simply providing exotic music in the lobby” (Roberts 1998:205). As an island that is marketed as having a unique social and cultural environment from other parts of Indonesia (Sofield 2001:113), tourism has become an essential component of many styles and traditions of Balinese music. While “tourism has become one of South-East Asia’s foremost industries” (Hitchcock, King and Parnwell 1993:1), its connection with music

\(^{18}\) Compare Giurchescu’s (1990) work on the use of traditional symbols for recasting the present in Romanian tourism.

\(^{19}\) Roberts identifies the drum-kit and synthesizer as being western, an interesting reference as such instruments are found in numerous cultures the world over.
and other performing arts is almost inseparable in many Balinese contexts.\textsuperscript{20} That is, in many instances tourism in Bali is often dependent on the performing arts, and many performing arts have become dependent on the tourism industry.

It is in such recontextualisations that one can observe the invention of tradition. The genre \textit{kecak} (or \textit{cak}, the Monkey Dance) is a fine example.\textsuperscript{21} It developed in the 1930s with the help of members of the non-Balinese community living in Bali, Walter Spies (1895-1942) and Katharane Mershon (1892-1986), painter and author respectively. The chanting of the sacred \textit{sanghyang} exorcism rituals caught their attention and they incorporated elements for dramatic effect. Having gone through several stages of change, today, men sit in circles and chant to accompany the Hindu Ramayana story (around one hundred men is not uncommon). Popularly referred to as the ‘Monkey Dance’ because of the chanting sounds and the references to monkeys in the story, the genre is today performed particularly as tourist entertainment with, as Dunbar-Hall (2001:177) points out, around nine performances advertised in Ubud every week (see also Picard 1996:149-151). Nevertheless, while \textit{kecak} might have an historic connection with \textit{sanghyang} rituals and tourist performances, it is also a creative art that has inspired Balinese performing artists to extend and develop it further. For example, as Tenzer (1991:98-99) has commented:

I Wayan Dibia, an important contemporary choreographer, took an interest in \textit{cak} during the early 1980s and devised several ingenious new versions of it, one of which was designed to be enacted on Kuta beach at sunset. Tourists and villagers alike stared in fascination as the dancers, freed from the confines of the normal performance arena, splashed through the water, the \textit{cak} rhythms blending seamlessly into the roar of the surf.

Dunbar-Hall (2001:174) has shown the movement of Balinese music and dance from a perceived original context to a tourist context “and how this translation acts as an agent in ongoing artistic development”. The recontextualisation of some traditions of Balinese music from the sacred to the profane (religious contexts to tourist contexts) has, it seems, not had a major impact on the meaning of the genres. “[The] separation of the sacred and profane is in fact alien to the Balinese, for whom the gods are always present whenever they dance, and who therefore draw little distinction between ceremonies and festivals which take place outside temple precincts and inside temple grounds and walls” (Sofield 2001:112). In this sense, the tourist presentation maintains an original meaning and the tourist façade serves to extend place. This idea is explored also by Rubenstein (1992), who looks at the idea of the cultural show and questions whether it is culture or not – perhaps also seeking an authentic culture. In connection with some performing

\textsuperscript{20} For a collection of essays on interconnected worlds and tourism in Southeast Asia see Teo, Chang and Ho (2001).

\textsuperscript{21} Ballinger (1993) notes several new forms of dance and drama.
arts in Bali, Rubenstein (1992:15), who draws from Picard (1990), notes that:

The question of how to incorporate the outsider as viewer into the proceedings is complex. There the performer often enters into trance, and the religious experience entails the danger of ritual pollution or curse if performed in an impure state. This is believed to hold true even if the dance is performed for outsiders and even if the trance is wholly or partially simulated.

But tourist contexts do change one level of meaning in that what might have been part of entertainment or ritual is now part of an economy that is fundamentally driven by the tourist dollar, although McKean (1989:124) notes that “traditional roles have not been entirely replaced or substituted with those found in the capitalistic West”.

Balinese music in tourist contexts is music that is often out of place on the one hand, but necessarily in place on the other hand. The music is presented as entertainment, even though its so-called traditional or pre-tourist context is more often than not for ritual or other ceremonial occasion. The music’s new context is of course an authentic one, analysis of which shows that while music structures can stay more or less the same, it is the meaning of those structures that has the most importance. As Hitchcock, King and Parnwell (1993:11) stress, “touristic culture is very much a part of reality”. Nevertheless, the meaning of the music is perhaps considerably different for performers and audience. The audience, for instance, would probably not know the pre-invented contexts and their Balinese associations. Rather, the tourist is exposed to a music and understands it through non-Balinese ears and eyes. In the context of the world music industry, as Mitchell (1996:85) notes, “to the white Western listener, world music may often be an entirely synthetic sonic experience of surface impacts”.

Kirshenblatt-Gimblett (1995:369) refers to a type of heritage that is created through such media as performance and which is a product of “transvaluation of the obsolete, the mistaken, the outmoded, the dead, and the defunct”. Are Balinese music performances for the tourist industry part of this type of heritage? In the case of Bali, the music performed for tourists is not necessarily outmoded music that has been rediscovered as representative of an imagined Balinese heritage. Rather, it is instead, a living heritage that is imagined as representative of Balinese heritage through its recontextualisation and changes in its ethnoscape, that is, the shift in the make-up of the audience. While time will allow the music researcher to compare change in terms of the music’s meanings, in the present day and near past, the music performed as part of Bali’s tourist industry is part of a process of exhibition – a display, a celebration, and an imagined and very much lived part of what it often means to be a Balinese musician in contemporary Balinese culture.

---

Balinese music and tourism ethnomusicology provides an opportunity for the music researcher to examine the effects of mass culture contact and changing contexts and meanings of music. In one such context, the effects of tourism on music in one village of Bali have been described by Sanger (1988). She notes that the village of Singapadu is introduced three or four times a week to bus loads of tourists flocking to see the local barong (mythical creature) dance-drama. They stay for just over one hour on what is usually part of a larger cultural tour. “This short ‘event’ leaves everyone happy: the tourists, having enjoyed the show, feel they have sampled authentic culture (which strings of photographs can prove to friends back home); and the villagers, having had a pleasurable social and musical experience, reap a financial reward that benefits the whole community” (Sanger 1988:89; see also Hitchcock, King and Parnwell 1993:10). Other typical Balinese performances for tourists include the legong dance and drama set to the Ramayana Hindu epic. Both would normally be accompanied by gamelan. Such performances are part of Balinese cultural tourism. As Picard (1996:134-163) comments, Balinese are very much concerned about the dichotomy between what arts should be for tourists and what arts should be reserved for themselves. Bali has known tourism from the early twentieth century, when tourists might have watched the barong dance-drama in what is today often referred to as an authentic setting for three hours or more (Sanger 1988:92), but it was only from the 1970s that mass tourism had a major impact. The barong dance-drama has two meanings: it is a rite where “the underlying theme is always that of the contest between good and evil forces, which must, if possible, be kept in balance” (Sanger 1988:92); and it is also tourist entertainment. Singapadu villagers have invented a tradition with religious connections, but have also invented one with commercial interests in the tourist industry. Sanger (1988:92) even notes that “more important, the villagers themselves were aware of the possible conflict of religious and commercial interests”. The villagers justify the commercial use of their ritual barong in several ways, including not abandoning offerings in the tourist context; not using the most sacred barong for tourists; using their tourist income communally; stressing that the barong actually likes to dance; arguing that tourist performances help village solidarity; and that the performers never compromise standards for tourists (Sanger 1988:92-96).

There are of course other influences on Balinese music that also contribute to change (see also Sanger 1988). On Java, for example, one can see changes in the arts that have little to do with tourism, but are more often due to the effects of other influences. As Susilo (1996) discusses, the contemporary Javanese forms of wayang kulit (shadow puppetry) have been condensed from the traditional all-night versions. He notes that the changes have been a result of a changing society in that “there has been a change in attitude and a new feeling of liberation from the court restrictions on behaviour” (133). In Bali, like many other places in the world, people are exposed to globalisation (this concept is explored in the next section). However, even with such global influences “commoditization of the barong
dance-drama has not affected religious life to any great extent” (Sanger 1988:98). Furthermore, while some ritual music is performed for tourists, some secular music invented in the 1960s is now performed for rituals (Sanger 1988:99). Of particular importance here are Sanger’s (1988:102) comments that “Balinese are used to coping with many levels of meaning and function, and the tourist dimension has been merged into the traditional framework, rather than permitted to destroy it”. Indeed, there is not always a clear distinction between local culture and tourist culture (see Picard 1993). Still, “while hotel performances are mostly of high quality, they can only give an inkling of the experience that Balinese music offers in its natural environment at temples in villages around the island. ... Visitors are welcome and encouraged to attend these events” (Tenzer 1991:123).

To conclude this part of the discussion the paper will now refer to several profiles of important Balinese musicians as noted in Tenzer (1991). While not answering all the questions asked by Stokes (1999:144) regarding reflections of participants, this section will close by showing parts of three such profiles, each of which helps show an insider’s perspective of the influences of music and tourism on Bali today:

I Wayan Tembres

I have never asked for money as a teacher. It’s not right to do so.23 The rewards come to you anyhow, in other ways. We get a token fee for performing in the hotels now that we never used to get, but it’s not enough for anyone to consider that a reason for doing those performances. We do them for the activity and the challenge, and for the strength of the sekaha organization [music club]. In the temples, of course, it’s our duty to play for free and it always will be. No one fails to meet those obligations, and that’s why our tradition is so strong (Tenzer 1991:115).

Dr Made Bandem

Dr Made Bandem “spent much of the late 60s and 70s as a student in the United States, ultimately obtaining a Ph.D. in ethnomusicology from Wesleyan University” (Tenzer 1991:115-17). He stated:

The Balinese are a very tolerant and creative people. What this in effect means for our performing arts is that absorption of outside influences and internal growth move at a rate much too quick for us to document and codify completely. Each generation of

23 During my field study in Bali my teacher did charge a fee for lessons, as did many other leading players. It is perhaps a legitimate source from foreign visitors (tourists and researchers alike).
musicians in our society will have a markedly different history from its predecessors and successors.

Many groups are overworked – some perform nightly – and are not always able to do their best. We’re initiating a program to have our students and graduates help to organize the village groups and negotiate on their behalf with hotel managers for reasonable performance schedules. We would also like to see some graduates employed as artistic directors at the hotels themselves, where they would organize the music and dance programs and work to educate visitors about what is presented (Tenzer 1991:115).

I Wayan Rai

I Wayan Rai completed an M.A. in Ethnomusicology at San Diego State University in the USA:

Most of the performances in town [Ubud] are for tourists, but now the general attitude is that if you’re not active in the temples then you’re just a money-grabber and not a true musician.

Tourism has both positive and negative effects, obviously, but in general I think it has mainly been beneficial (Tenzer 1991:117-19).

Tourism at Home

Tourism is difficult to define. Przeclawski (1993:12), for instance, identifies ten broad types of tourism:24

a) cognitive tourism, that is discovering nature, past cultures, contemporary culture, other people, oneself

b) tourism for recreation and entertainment

c) tourism for health treatment

d) ‘creative tourism’ - one’s creative work or work for the benefit of the population visited

e) educational tourism

f) professional tourism - business, congresses, conferences

24 On other definitions and discussions of the concept of tourism compare for example Abram, Waldren and Macleod (1997), Clifford (1997), Smith (1989:4-6), and Urry (1990).
g) pilgrimage tourism

h) tourism for family reasons

i) sex tourism

j) profit-making tourism

These categories certainly help to show the diversity of purpose, but do not restrict them to the idea of entering another country. While there are probably too many types of tourism to mention here, several questions do arise from the above categories. Is tourism simply travel? Can one be a tourist in one’s own home? That is, not only in the sense of going on a trip but, for example, by consuming aspects of another culture without actually visiting its geographic location. Indeed, tourism is not always simply about people visiting a geographic location in terms of physically departing home and then travelling away from home to a foreign land (see also Clifford 1997; DeWitt 1999a). The travelling implies that it is at a distance, where the tourist becomes an outsider vis-à-vis an insider. Smith (1989:1), for example, says that the tourist “visits a place away from home for the purpose of experiencing a change”. Moreover, a feature of postmodern society is that many boundaries are no longer distinguishable and, thus, tourism becomes increasingly difficult to identify from some other travel practices. While tourism at home is certainly connected with ideas of heritage and local celebration that is so often found in the heritage industry, it is also necessarily linked to other modes of communication, or scapes, in that one place, or culture, might influence another and the only connection is through the consumption of objects that are exported or reproduced to represent a place. It is here that one enters a tourist/travel sphere of real and imagined routes or ethnoscapes between peoples and cultures. What is particularly interesting about travel in this sense is that a physical place is not always a process, but often a concept. One might view tourism at home as a route into an ‘other’, a way of travelling to an imagined exotic or distant culture without actually getting on a plane.  

The consumption of objects through globalisation and ethnoscapes, in what points to DeWitt’s (1999a:73) use of the term “virtual tourism” or Taylor’s (1997:19) description of world music as “sonic tourism”, provides the means by which an imagined ‘other’ can be entered and experienced without actually being there.

Balinese Roots/Routes

Balinese music has played a major part in the globalisation of aspects of

---

25 The study of exoticism has been explored in much depth by Said (1978). For discussions of music exoticism see also, for example, Hayward (1999 and 2001), Johnson (2001 and 2002), Mitsui (1998), and Pope (1998).

26 The idea of roots/routes is noted in Clifford (1997:36).
Balinese culture. The phenomenon of globalised music is of course not limited to Balinese music, and one can find many other examples of world musics in many cultures where they are consumed as symbols of their real and imagined original culture (if there is one at all). Balinese music today is not restricted to only Bali or Indonesia, or even to a nation state near Indonesia that has historically been influenced by Indonesian culture (for example Malaysia). It is found in many other near and distant cultures where its cultural origins are imagined in the course of its consumption. With many musics, as Stokes (1994:3) comments, “the musical event, from collective dances to the act of putting a cassette or CD into a machine, evokes and organises collective memories and present experiences of place with an intensity, power and simplicity unmatched by any other social activity”.

Globalisation in recent years has provided a means by which Balinese music has been transported around the globe in various ways and for a number of different reasons. While early western observations of gamelan were described by Sir Francis Drake in 1590, more recently it was the nineteenth- and early twentieth-century travellers who did much to increase awareness of Bali to Europeans. Such western composers as Claude Debussy (1862-1918), Colin McPhee (1900-1964), Benjamin Britten (1913-1976), Olivier Messiaen (1908-1992), John Cage (1912-1992), Steve Reich (b 1936), and Lou Harrison (b 1917) have each been inspired and influenced by gamelan music in one way or another. For example, Harrison has composed large numbers of pieces for gamelan and western instruments, and Reich’s compositional style reflects the repetitive structures found in gamelan music. While a Javanese gamelan troupe first visited the west at the Paris International Exhibition in 1889, Tenzer (1991:16) comments that:

The first Balinese group to tour abroad was the ensemble from Peliatan village, which played in Paris in 1931. A much more lavish and extensive tour by the same ensemble took place in 1952, organized by British entrepreneur John Coast. The group was a sensation in London, New York and Las Vegas and impressed the intricacies of Balinese music and dance on an international audience for the first time.

Today, Balinese gamelan ensembles are increasingly touring overseas (see for example www.geocities.com/taribali/dwimekar0.htm), ensembles are being established outside Bali, and listeners of the music are found in diverse world contexts.

---

27 Sorrell (1990:1-17) provides an informative summary of gamelan and the west.
28 Claude Debussy heard a Javanese gamelan at the Paris International Exhibition in 1889.
29 McPhee heard some recordings of the Odeon company made in Bali and began a long career captivated by the island and its music. He lived in Bali for eight years from 1931 until the outbreak of war. His work *Music in Bali* (1966) is a summary of his life’s work on Balinese music.
30 Britten made transcriptions of gamelan music in Bali, and some of his compositions attempt to reproduce gamelan sounds (eg *The Prince of the Pagodas*).
31 McKean (1989:119) notes the year as 1932.
Bali in the World Music Industry

The world music industry is very much connected with globalisation. Indeed, world music has had an immense impact on the music industry. The production, distribution, and consumption of music has an inherent commercial interest that aims to make a profit. In order to achieve this aim, music is packaged and marketed to an ever increasing number of consumers in many different ways. Wherever the music is from and whatever its style, the consumption of world music is a commercial process that is packaged in a variety of media to many world societies. While an equivocal term, ‘world music’ has been used by the music industry since 1987, at first by Folkways in order to label and market essentially non-western music (at first, primarily African music). In the mid 1980s there was a rapid increase of interest, in the western world, in commercially available recordings of the musics of the world. Under the label world music, record companies increasingly sold their new product to a world audience. Included in such recordings were the ubiquitous gamelan recordings, which featured, and still feature, musics of Bali. While some products are produced for a national or even regional market, the part of the music culture industry connected directly to globalisation is built on the assumption that its product can sell across cultural, national, and geographic borders, even if some meanings are lost and others added.

Record companies have long been involved in multi-national markets, and recording artists are often eclectic in their sources of inspiration, which might include drawing on other cultures and subcultures. However, since the term world music or world beat was coined in the marketing of world music, the music industry has actively been involved in a range of commercial activities involving the musics of the world. There is perhaps no other industry that has explored and exploited aspects of the world’s cultures quite like this one, which is controlled essentially in the western world by a handful of main companies. What perhaps makes this industry unique in contemporary global flows is the fact that at its heart is the immediate consumption of a culture’s meaningful artifact (such as music), in a context usually far removed from that culture and probably by people who understand very little or indeed anything about the language and meaning connected with that object. While perhaps viewed as simulacra on the one hand, it is on the other hand a consumer product that might have ethnic appeal, a trait inherent in the marketing of such objects, as an object of ‘otherness’, one that inherently still carries its cultural associations albeit masked by a shroud of consumer fetishism. It could be referred to along the lines of Smith’s (1989:4)

32 The terms world music and world beat were coined to replace broad terms like international, ethnic, non-western, folk, and global, mainly for the purpose of categorising music in record stores. Today, even more labels are used in marketing world music, such as roots or the name of a specific country or continent. The term world music was used earlier primarily by academics to describe primarily non-western music.

33 Manuel (1988:4) notes that “roughly half the records sold today [1988] are produced by a mere five multinational companies (CBS, EMI, Polygram, WEA, and RCS)”.
comments on “ethnic tourism”, which “is marketed to the public in terms of the ‘quaint’ customs of indigenous and often exotic peoples”.

While referring to this type of tourism as usually away from one’s home, the consumption of ethnic appeal in one’s home challenges the boundaries of such a tourist category. Getting there can be done far more quickly than by getting on a plane. As MacCannell (2001:389) asks, why leave home at all? World music comes in many different brands. Heaton (1994:417) refers to the gamelan of Java and Bali as “a storm of bronze”; “enchanted music”; it “perplexed western visitors”. But she also mentions gamelan workshops that have become popular in the west (ibid., 423). She asks, “what is it that draws people to the gamelan? ‘It calms me down after a day’s work’, says one person at my workshop; ‘the music reaches a part of me that nothing else does’, reveals another; and one says, simply, ‘I just love being around the instruments’” (ibid).

Very often record companies place a variety of musics under the one label of world music. In the same category one might find for example traditional, popular, or even crossover music where a western artist has collaborated with musicians of a different culture and the music very much takes the style of the latter but maintains the marketing power of the former (for example, Paul Simon’s album Graceland of 1986). Balinese music is one type of world music that has been successfully marketed within the world music industry as part of its global cannon. However, the consumption of gamelan tends to focus on a perceived traditional music that has been encapsulated in a way that maintains its exoticism. Usually, any traces of recent culture contact or eclectic elements, which embody much of contemporary gamelan music, are ignored by world music followers. “It is this global hybridized dimension of gamelan music that is ignored (perhaps even denied) by World Music through its exclusive focus on gamelan in its traditional, local forms - all the more ironic, given that the emergence of World Music itself is symptomatic of this process of globalization” (Roberts 1998:205).

One example of early recordings of Balinese music being sold commercially to a western audience was with Nonesuch Records. Musicologist David Lewiston, who collaborated with the record company was very influential at the time and first recorded Balinese music in 1966.

Lewiston ... went to Bali in the mid-sixties [1966] and decided to record some [of] the local musicians. . . .The music was so powerful that Tracy Sterne decided to release what turned out to be the flagship recording of The Nonesuch Explorer Series. It was the first time anybody had attempted to market ‘international

34 For a useful critical study of Graceland see Meintjes (1990).
music’, especially ethnic field recordings, as entertainment for adventurous listeners (Roden 2001:online).

It is with such music exoticism that the connection between music, tourism, and the commercial music industry gets closer. That is, Lewiston actually comments that “I prefer to be described as a ‘musical tourist’” (Lewiston, quoted in Roden 2001:online). Lewiston was concerned principally with the non-tourist market, but promoted Balinese music as though it was a tourist product. This perspective is emphasised when he notes that “when I returned to the island in 1987 I was overjoyed to find that its arts were still alive and vibrant, unspoiled by the rampant tourism which had overtaken much of Balinese life” (Lewiston, quoted in Roden 2001:online).

**Bali and Music Education**

Music exoticism is inherent in the world music industry, and Balinese tourism is concerned primarily with a commercial product, the ‘other’. The consumption of any ‘other’ in many world societies is not, of course, determined only by consumer fetishism. While some transplanted musics from around the world have their own communities of people from the original culture to go with them, Balinese gamelan is more often than not found globally being performed primarily by non-Balinese (however, many Balinese visit overseas to teach gamelan to non-Balinese). One sphere where the musical ‘other’ is explored without (mostly) such commodification is in western music education. In connection with images created in the world music industry, Roberts (1998:205) notes that:

> Browsing through the ‘Indonesia’ section of the World Music department in any record store, one might easily conclude that gamelan music did not exist outside Indonesia. In a sense, this should cause little surprise: global capitalism and its associated culture industries depend on the construction of a cultural otherness that can be presented as the ‘authentic’ instance of a culture to consumers.

However, from the 1950s music education in the western world took particular notice of Indonesian gamelan groups and even started to import entire ensembles of instruments for use in a number of contexts from music education to community groups. In particular, the discipline of ethnomusicology (the anthropology of music) did much for bimusicality (Hood 1960) and learning of non-western musics in western education systems. Indeed, within many non-Indonesian universities Indonesian gamelan ensembles (including those from Bali) have been established and today play an important role in the music education of many music students the world over. This global creativity (see also Stimpson and Bhabha 1998:183) might be viewed as exoticism on the one hand, but on the other hand it is very much an heuristic practice that attempts to understand the musical ‘other’ without
necessarily commodifying it.

O’Connor (2002) argues against such educational practices in the west being classified as postmodern flows and raises questions about the lack of ethnographic research in studies of music hybrids across such scapes proposed by Appadurai (1996). What is especially interesting about the flow of Balinese gamelan outside Bali is that there are specific conduits that allow such a study of society and culture. The University of California at Los Angeles received the first gamelan to be exported from Bali, which was shipped there in the late 1950s (Tenzer 1991:126). As a global phenomenon, “gamelan music is now taught and practised by a remarkably diverse community, circulating in a global network of arts festivals and concert tours. Indonesian gamelans are regular performers on the World Music circuit, while non-Indonesian gamelans perform at festivals in Bali and the Javanese city of Yogyakarta” (Roberts 1998:204). One such non-Balinese gamelan group, the American Sekar Jaya (Flowering Success), has made a huge impact on global Balinese music:

In 1985, 1992, and again in 1995, the Governor of Bali personally invited Gamelan Sekar Jaya to undertake concert tours to Bali and Java – a unique recognition of the group’s achievements, especially coming from a culture that takes immense pride in their performing arts traditions. These invitations were not taken lightly: new music and dance works were created for all three tours, and added to the group’s repertoire of more traditional compositions. More than one year of intensive rehearsal and preparation preceded each tour.

The response by Indonesian audiences in all three of these tours was, in a word, overwhelming. The performances were greeted with wild enthusiasm by local audiences, who filled all the halls to overflowing. The media response in an outpouring of articles and reviews in the newspapers, and broadcast of live concerts by Indonesian National Television (TVRI) and Radio (RRI) (www.gsj.org/profile.cfm).

One cannot help but wonder how the audience at a Balinese tourist performance would react to such a group of non-Balinese performing in Bali. Moreover, “there are currently over eighty gamelan ensembles based in the United States and Canada, and active groups in Australia, France, Germany, Japan, the Netherlands, New Zealand and the United Kingdom” (Roberts 1998:204). Such gamelan groups are very much connected with global flows, but also provide insight into the educational side of the practice of consuming the ‘other’, whether explicitly or not, so often found in postmodern global societies.

---

36 Tenzer (1991:126-27) outlines Balinese music abroad and lists some of the Balinese gamelan found outside Bali, in embassies, consulates, and at universities. For information on many non-Balinese gamelan (as well as gamelan in general) see www.gamelan.org.
Conclusion

Globalisation is often connected with cultural (very often western) hegemony. But the recent history of global consumerism has also produced non-American giants. Whether it is Japanese electronics or German luxury cars, industries such as these have the primary purpose to sell their product in markets that seem to be getting larger in terms of consumerism, but smaller in terms of the spread of global consumerism. There are, of course, other products of global travel that have a recent history of being transmitted from one culture and then consumed in others. However, the difference between consuming a Starbucks’ coffee (American?) and some sushi (Japanese?), for example, is that while both are very much the products of increasing global flows, the former is analogous to many other consumer giants that dominate so many markets the world over, while the latter is more likely to be the product of a local industry that is cashing in on the recent popularisation of Japanese cuisine around the world. The marketing of music across cultures is not necessarily always a product of globalisation that provides profits to western companies. There are other global, national, and regional flows that reflect global consumer practices but are not always connected directly to the western world. For example, the Japanisation of some Eastern markets of ‘Jpop’ (Japanese popular music) is a phenomenon that on the one hand reflects global practices but on the other hand is, in effect, Japanisation. Furthermore, some world musics have been transmitted from one culture to another many years before the concept of globalisation was first coined, and have continued to do so not necessarily only for the purpose of making money. The adoption of western music by many non-western cultures is a fine example, where a performance and consumption of, for instance, Bach, Beethoven, or Brahms is just as much part of local music culture as it is part of a European culture or western art music.

As a means for promoting tourism, heritage, and identity, music as or in a performing art is increasingly used as a tool for representing a specific nation, region or culture through sound and symbol. There are both positive and negative consequences. For example, financial gain, bringing communities together, and preserving traditional musics on the one hand; but giving the visitor a false art, creating a financial dependence, and driving communities apart through cultural competition on the other hand. For the music researcher the recontextualisation of Balinese music in tourist performances and other global spheres has created new performance contexts that demand enquiry regarding understanding the place of music today. The field is often contradictory. One no longer has to go to Bali to study Bali and the local/global dynamics of place are indeed brought to the foreground in such instances. While scholars such as Appadurai (1996), Bhabha (1994), Bryman (1995), and Ritzer (2000), describe homogenisation and hybridisation, Balinese music has also been hybridised within Bali, although not always perceived so by Balinese and non-Balinese alike, and outside Bali by its consumption in global markets. The complexities and contradictions of an imagined
globalisation has produced commodity fetishism and consumption of Balinese music outside Bali, but as Featherstone (1990:10) notes “there is little prospect of a unified global culture, rather there are global cultures in the plural”.

With Bali, so much importance is given to tourism and music in Bali itself, as well as a global interest in things Balinese, that this paper becomes especially significant in questioning the ethnographic site of investigation. It is multi-sited within the global ecumene (see also Hannerz 1992; Marcus 1998:33-56). Balinese music is today in the individual and collective imagination of many people around the world who have not even set foot on the island. For many others, Balinese music is in their memory from experiencing it first hand in Bali itself as tourists. For the music researcher, therefore, Balinese music is in many places. As a phenomenon in Bali itself it demands enquiry in terms of its use in contexts of tourism; as a product in the world music industry it demands enquiry regarding its popularity as a commercial object sold globally; and as a genre in music education and community groups it provides a context that challenges the notion that one must do fieldwork in the ‘field’, or perhaps provides new ‘fields’ at home and abroad.
References


Johnson


Websites

www.gamelan.org
www.geocities.com/taribali/dwimekar0.htm
www.gsj.org/profile.cfm